Impact of COVID-19 on CORSIA Annie Petsonk, International Counsel Pedro Piris-Cabezas, Director, Sustainable Int. Transport & Lead Senior Economist Maggie McCallister, High Meadows Fellow

© Environmental Defense Fund 2020



Finding the ways that work

How did we get here?

1995 UNFCCC unable to reach agreement on how to allocate emissions of international transport.

2008 ICAO inaction. EU puts aviation in EU-ETS from 2013.

2012

Airlines lobby US Congress which enacts EU ETS Prohibition Act. Trade war if EU goes ahead.

1997 At airlines' request, COP asks ICAO to act. 2009-2010 Airlines sue to stop EU; IATA calls for cap on int'l emissions from 2020 (carbonneutral growth from 2020).

2013 EU "stops the clock" on ETS pending ICAO action.

2016

As requested by airlines, ICAO adopts CORSIA, sets baseline at 2019-2020 average despite warnings of risks of using future rather than historical base years.

CORSIA's Offsetting Formula

ICAO Resolution Paragraph 11:

"Recalls its decision at the 39th Session that the amount of CO2 emissions required to be offset by an aeroplane operator in a given year from 2021 is calculated every year as follows:

A an aeroplane operator's offset requirement = [% Sectoral x (an aeroplane operator's emissions covered by CORSIA in a given year x the sector's growth factor in the given year x that aeroplane operator's growth factor in the given year);
B Where the sector's growth factor = (total emissions covered by CORSIA in a given year – average of total emissions covered by CORSIA between 2019 and 2020) / total emissions covered by CORSIA in the given year

EDF's Assumptions

Numbers

According to the most recent ICAO Council <u>"Global</u> <u>Environmental Trends" document</u>, emissions in 2019 were approximately 555 MMT (million metric tonnes) of CO2



Coverage

We estimate that, during the Pilot Phase (2021-2023) and phase 1 (2024-2026), participation will cover roughly 60% of sectoral emissions above 2020 levels; over the full program (2021-2035), participation will cover roughly 80%



Base Case

Using the <u>Trends</u>' "Low Aircraft Technology" scenario, we calculate a Pre-Covid19 Pilot Phase Anticipated Demand with 2019-2020 Baseline of 78 MMT for the covered routes (2360 MMT for full program demand)



CORSIA Post-COVID Demand

Emissions Trajectories under Five COVID Scenarios: V, V, U, L, V

Scenario 1: The "V". Emissions rebound fully by 2021 and return to a BAU trajectory

Scenario 1: Full, Fast Emissions Rebound



Scenario 2: "V". Emissions rebound to 2013 levels in 2021 with subsequent year on year growth



Scenario 3: The "U". Emissions rebound slowly to 2019 levels in 2024 with subsequent year on year growth



Scenario 4: The "L". Emissions fall and do not rebound, with minimal growth post-2021

Scenario 4: Emissions Fall, then Level Off



Scenario 5: The "√". Emissions overshoot pre-COVID BAU predictions

Scenario 5: Overshoot





CORSIA's Pilot Phase Flexibility Mechanism (PPFM)

ICAO Resolution paragraph 11(e):

"where the % sector and % Individual will be applied as follows:

- from 2021 through 2023, 100% sectoral and 0% individual, though each participating State may choose during this Pilot Phase whether to apply this to:
 - A an aeroplane operator's emissions covered by CORSIA in a given year, as stated above, or
 - B an aeroplane operator's emissions covered by CORSIA in 2020;"

CORSIA Emissions Unit Demand: Five Post-COVID Scenarios Pilot Phase (2021-2023)

Scenario 1 The "V": Full, Fast Emissions Rebound

The "V": Full recovery by 2021, Baseline 2019-2020: PPFM modulates the increase in offset obligation

Scenario 1: Full, Fast, Emissions Rebound



The "V": Full recovery by 2021, Baseline 2019-2020: PPFM modulates the increase in offset obligation



Anticipated CORSIA Pilot Phase (2021-2023) Demand in Scenario 1

	High	Severe	Extreme
2019-2020 Baseline	158	335	437
With Flexibility	125	157	123

Pre-COVID Anticipated Demand

Additional Offset Obligation, High Impact Scenario

- Additional Offset Obligation, Severe Impact Scenario
- Additional Offset Obligation, Extreme Impact Scenario
- High Impact Emissions
- Severe Impact Emissions
- Extreme Impact Emissions
- ---BAU

The "V": Full recovery by 2021, Baseline 2019 only: Offset demand would increase 15%



In "V" Scenario 1, with original 2019-2020 Baseline, PPFM modulates offset obligation

Scenario 1: Full, Fast Emissions Rebound 2019-2020 Baseline Obligation vs. 2019 Changed Baseline Obligation

Scenario 2

The "V": Slightly Attenuated Rebound, Dampened Long Term Growth

Scenario 2 : "V", Baseline 2019-2020: PPFM reduces offset obligation to nearly pre-COVID levels

Anticipated CORSIA Pilot Phase (2021-2023) Demand in Scenario 2

	High	Severe	Extreme
2019-2020 Baseline	19	195	298
With Flexibility	17	105	96

Pre-COVID Anticipated Demand

Additional Offset Obligation, High Impact Scenario

Additional Offset Obligation, Severe Impact Scenario

Additional Offset Obligation, Extreme Impact Scenario

High Impact Emissions

— Severe Impact Emissions

Extreme Impact Emissions

---BAU

Scenario 2 : "V", Baseline 2019-2020: PPFM reduces offset obligation to nearly pre-COVID levels

Anticipated CORSIA Pilot Phase (2021-2023) Demand in Scenario 2

	High	Severe	Extreme
2019-2020 Baseline	19	195	298
With Flexibility	17	105	96

Pre-COVID Anticipated Demand

Additional Offset Obligation, High Impact Scenario

Additional Offset Obligation, Severe Impact Scenario

Additional Offset Obligation, Extreme Impact Scenario

High Impact Emissions

- Severe Impact Emissions
- Extreme Impact Emissions

The "V": Dampened emissions, Baseline 2019 only: Offset obligation would vanish until 2024

The "V": PPFM reduces offset obligation to pre-COVID levels; 2019-only baseline eliminates offset obligation

Scenario 2: Slightly Attenuated Rebound, Dampened Long Term Growth 2019-2020 Baseline Obligation vs. 2019 Changed Baseline Obligation

Scenario 3 The "U": Slow Recovery, Dampened Long Term Growth

The "U": Baseline 2019-2020: Pilot Phase Offset Obligation Greatly Reduced

Scenario 3: Slow Recovery, Dampened Long Term Growth

Anticipated CORSIA Pilot Phase (2021-2023) Demand in Scenario 3

	High	Severe	Extreme
2019-2020 Baseline	10	22	29
With Flexibility	9	14	12

Pre-COVID Anticipated Demand

Additional Offset Obligation, High Impact Scenario

- Additional Offset Obligation, Severe Impact Scenario
- Additional Offset Obligation, Extreme Impact Scenario
- High Impact Emissions
- Severe Impact Emissions
- Extreme Impact Emissions
- ---BAU

The "U": Baseline 2019-2020: Pilot Phase Offset Obligation Greatly Reduced

Anticipated CORSIA Pilot Phase (2021-2023) Demand in Scenario 3

	High	Severe	Extreme
2019-2020 Baseline	10	22	29
With Flexibility	9	14	12

Pre-COVID Anticipated Demand
Additional Offset Obligation, High Impact Scenario
Additional Offset Obligation, Severe Impact Scenario
Additional Offset Obligation, Extreme Impact Scenario

- High Impact Emissions
- Severe Impact Emissions
- Extreme Impact Emissions
- ---BAU

The "U": Baseline 2019-only: Offset Obligation would vanish until 2025

The "U": Baseline 2019-only: Pilot Phase offset obligation would vanish

Scenario 3: Slow Recovery, Dampened Long Term Growth 2019-2020 Baseline Obligation vs. 2019 Changed Baseline Obligation

If baseline were changed to 2019, offset obligation in the "U" Scenario would be delayed beyond the Pilot Phase

Scenario 4 The "L": Emissions Fall, then Level Off

The L: Emissions Level Off. Under Baseline 2019-2020, no offset obligations

The L: Emissions Level Off. Under Baseline 2019-2020, no offset obligations

Scenario 4: Emissions Fall, then Level Off + Flexibility Mechanism

The "L": Emissions Level Off. Baseline 2019-only: Offset obligations would vanish beyond the Pilot Phase

The L: Regardless of baseline, there will be no offset obligation in the Pilot Phase

Scenario 4: Slow Recovery, Dampened Long Term Growth 2019-2020 Baseline Obligation vs. 2019 Changed Baseline Obligation

Scenario 5

The Overshoot "√": Emissions Exceed Pre-COVID Projections

The "√": When emissions overshoot pre-COVID projections, all scenarios see increased obligation

The "√": When emissions overshoot pre-COVID projections, all scenarios see increased obligation

The "√": When emissions overshoot pre-COVID projections, a 2019 baseline would result in increased obligation

The "√": PPFM would mitigate offset obligation commensurate with 2019-only baseline

Scenario 5: Emissions Overshoot

2019-2020 PPFM Obligation vs. 2019 Changed Baseline Obligation

Pilot Phase Post-COVID Scenarios (Pre-COVID BAU Demand=78)*

Soonaria		2019-2020 Baseline*		2019 Baseline*			
Scenario	DAU	High	Severe	Extreme	High	Severe	Extreme
S1 ("V")	78	158	335	437	92	92	92
S1+Flexibility	-	125	157	123	72	44	26
S2 (" ∖ ")	-	19	195	298	0	0	0
S2+Flexibility	-	17	105	96	0	0	0
S3 ("U")	-	10	22	29	0	0	0
S3+Flexibility	-	9	14	12	0	0	0
S4 ("L")	-	0	0	0	0	0	0
S4+Flexibility	-	0	0	0	0	0	0
S5 ("√")	-	205	382	485	139	139	139
S5+Flexibility	-	156	172	131	105	62	37

* All measurements in MMTCO₂

Pilot Phase Post-COVID Scenarios Percent Change Relative to Pre-COVID BAU Demand of 78 MMT

Soonaria		2019-2020 Baseline*		2019 Baseline*			
Scenario	DAU	High	Severe	Extreme	High	Severe	Extreme
S1 ("V")	78	+103%	+330%	+462%	+18%	+18%	+18%
S1+Flexibility	-	+61%	+102%	+59%	-7%	-43%	-67%
S2 (" \ ")	-	-75%	+150%	+282%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S2+Flexibility	-	-78%	+35%	+24%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S3 ("U")	-	-87%	-72%	-63%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S3+Flexibility	-	-88%	-82%	-85%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S4 ("L")	-	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S4+Flexibility	-	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%	-100%
S5 ("√")	-	+163%	+391%	+523%	+79%	+79%	+79%
S5+Flexibility	-	+100%	+121%	+68%	+35%	-20%	-52%

* All measurements in MMTCO₂

Full Program Demand Summary

Soonaria BALI*		2019-2020 Baseline*		2019 Baseline*			
Scenario	DAU	High	Severe	Extreme	High	Severe	Extreme
S1 ("V")	2360	2893	4073	4758	2454	2454	2454
% Change	-	+23%	+73%	+102%	+4%	+4%	+4%
S2 (" ∖ ")	2360	1464	2642	3327	1087	1087	1087
% Change	-	-38%	+12%	+41%	-54%	-54%	-54%
S3 ("U")	2360	1450	2378	2917	1087	1087	1087
% Change	-	-39%	+1%	+24%	-54%	-54%	-54%
S4 ("L")	2360	454	0	0	166	0	0
% Change	-	-81%	-100%	-100%	-93%	-100%	-100%
S5 ("√")	2360	3772	4952	5637	3333	3333	3333
% Change	-	+60%	+110%	+139%	+41%	+41%	+41%

* All measurements in MMTCO₂

Q: What about Supply in the Pilot Phase? A: With 2019-2020 Baseline, Supply is sufficient for Pilot Phase under all Scenarios

CORSIA Eligible Supply	386-569 MMT*
Demand (Extreme Scenarios)	474-485 MMT
Demand (Extreme Scenarios with Flexibility Mechanism)	156-172 MMT

 Supply could increase further as ICAO TAB and Council consider second round of offset program applications for CORSIA Pilot Phase

*Findings from Ecosystem Marketplace's March 2020 Analysis

Pilot Phase Post-COVID Scenarios Supply* Relative to Demand

		Supply	Demand: 2019-2020 Baseline*			
Scenario	Supply*	Exceeds Demand	High	Severe	Extreme	
S1 ("V")	386 - 569	yes for most	158	335	437	
S1+Flexibility	386 - 569	yes	125	156	123	
S2 (" \ ")	386 - 569	yes	19	195	298	
S2+Flexibility	386 - 569	yes	17	105	96	
S3 ("U")	386 - 569	yes	10	22	29	
S3+Flexibility	386 - 569	yes	9	14	12	
S4 ("L")	386 - 569	yes	0	0	0	
S4+Flexibility	386 - 569	yes	0	0	0	
S5 ("√")	386 - 569	yes for most	205	382	485	
S5+Flexibility	386 - 569	yes	156	172	131	

* MMTCO₂ *Supply Scenarios from Ecosystem Marketplace March 2020 Analysis

"Airline executives have warned of a slow recovery even after the virus is contained and have said demand may not recover to 2019 levels for years."

<u>"U.S. Airline Shares Tumble as Buffett Sell-Off Adds to Worries," 4 May 2020</u>

"...the world has changed for the airlines..."

Warren Buffet, 2 May 2020

CORSIA Baseline Conclusions

Key Takeaways:

Changing the baseline to 2019 causes offset obligations in the Pilot Phase to vanish in most scenarios Council has ensured CORSIA ample Pilot Phase supply; Flexibility Mechanism greatly reduces the Pilot Phase offset obligation

Changes to post-Pilot Phase offset obligation largely depend on timing and extent of aviation's rebound from COVID

3

Bottom Line:

A major change to CORSIA's structure should not be taken in a hurry.

The question should be considered by ICAO's 190+ member Assembly at their next regular meeting in 2022, by which time there will be more information about aviation's rebound.

Thank you!

Annie Petsonk International Counsel apetsonk@edf.org

Finding the ways that work