

State Momentum Continues for America's Clean Power Plan

At this moment of dynamism in the power sector, states are making tangible progress reducing carbon pollution and evaluating state-level regulatory options to comply with enforceable, clear limitations on carbon pollution from our nation's power plants. Many states are prudently moving forward with evaluating Clean Power Plan compliance options and continued stakeholder engagement. Across the country, senior officials in states opposed to the Clean Power Plan as well as states strongly supportive have constructively affirmed their efforts to continue working towards compliance and to secure critical reductions in carbon emissions from the power sector.

* * *

Continued State Progress Following 2016 Election

Arkansas

• Arkansas Public Service Commission chairman Ted Thomas <u>said</u> in Feb. 2017: "In the past three weeks, to me as a Republican appointed by a Republican governor, I'm not reassured by the progress the Congress and the administration are making. ... If they don't get it together, we're going to have a different administration in four years, and that's when folks might wish they had the Clean Power Plan."

Thomas explained that most of the price risk of the federal climate rule would have come in the second half of the next decade anyway. "There are still scenarios with a cost of carbon presented," Thomas said. "And to me, a utility commissioner isn't doing their job, given that they make a long-term projection, if they're not including resource diversity that includes non-carbon resources."

California

• After the 2016 election, Gov. Jerry Brown mounted a vigorous defense of California's climate leadership and the role they will continue to play in setting the stage for ongoing progress and defending the important progress of the last eight years. "We've got the scientists, we've got the lawyers and we're ready to fight. We're ready to defend," he maintained.

Colorado

 Governor John Hickenlooper continues to display strong leadership and a keen understanding of the imperative to move to a low-carbon future. After the election, Hickenlooper said he <u>remains committed</u> to fulfilling the goals of the Clean Power Plan, no matter what happens to the rule.

Illinois

• On Dec. 7, 2016, Illinois enacted a <u>comprehensive new energy bill</u> that will in part double the state's energy efficiency portfolio and allow for 4,300 MW of new solar and wind power, while providing for continued operation of zero-emission nuclear facilities, which will reduce the state's carbon emissions 56% by 2030.

Maryland

• On Feb. 2, 2017, the Maryland legislature <u>voted to override</u> Gov. Larry Hogan's veto of a bill to increase the state's Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS). The bill increases the RPS to 25% by 2020, up from 20% by 2022.

Michigan

• On Dec. 15, 2016, Michigan <u>lawmakers approved a new bill</u> to increase the state's renewable portfolio standard to 15% by 2021, up from 10%. Republican Gov. Rick Snyder touted the bill in a statement: "What we're in is a huge transition in how we get our energy. We've got a lot of aging coal plants that are beyond their useful life, and it's not worth investing in them anymore. ... We can transition to both natural gas and renewables and let the markets sort of define the balance between those two, so we're moving away from an old energy source [where] we had to import all of this coal."

Minnesota

• From <u>ClimateWire</u> (Jan. 24, 2017): "To be sure, not every state has abandoned the Clean Power Plan. Minnesota's air officials just scheduled a stakeholder meeting for next month to explain where challenges to the regulation stand. ... Even if Minnesota stops official Clean Power Plan work, [Frank] Kohlasch, [an air assessments section manager at the state's Pollution Control Agency,] said his agency may keep using the same stakeholder group to look at ways to cut carbon. He added that through the regulation, Minnesota has developed regional conversations among environment and energy officials. He acknowledged the rule's deadlines added some urgency to the talks and without it other states likely will not work as much on carbon reductions. But he said he believes trends toward natural gas, renewable power and energy savings will continue regardless.

Nevada

• Nevada state Assemblyman Chris Brooks <u>introduced</u> legislation on Feb. 13, 2017, that would increase the state's renewable portfolio standard to 50% by 2030 and 80% by 2040. In an <u>interview</u>, Brooks said, ""When you see zero leadership coming from D.C. on issues of such importance, states feel the urgency. I believe that is why states have ratcheted up these [clean energy] initiatives. ... Renewable energy is a winning story here in Nevada and we want to double down on that."

New York

- In January 2017, Gov. Andrew Cuomo <u>announced</u> a new commitment for New York to reduce greenhouse gas emissions 30 percent below 2020 levels by 2030. Cuomo also called upon other Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) states to follow suit. "With this proposal, New York will lower the emissions cap even further and set the precedent for recognizing and taking action against climate change to support the future of communities across the globe," Cuomo said in a press release.
- In his 2017 State of the State address, Gov. Andrew Cuomo <u>committed</u> to building 2.4 GW of offshore wind by 2030, adding, "and we are not going to stop until we reach 100% renewable because that's what a sustainable New York is really all about."

North Carolina

• On March 9, 2017, North Carolina <u>withdrew</u> its legal challenge to the Clean Power Plan. North Carolina was one of 27 states suing the EPA over the CPP. Said Dept. of Environmental Quality secretary Michael Regan in a <u>press release</u>: ""We are pleased the court granted our motion to withdraw from this case. We did not feel this case was a good use of our agency's or taxpayers' resources, and it did not align with our mission. This will enable us to devote more of our time and energy toward protection of air, water and natural resources."

Ohio

• Late in 2016, Gov. John Kasich <u>vetoed</u> a bill that would have effectively extended the state's freeze on renewable energy standards for two more years. With Gov. Kasich's veto, the standards came back into effect in January 2017. From <u>Cleveland.com</u> (Dec. 27, 2016): "In vetoing Substitute House Bill 554, Kasich credited Ohio's 'wide range of energy generation options' with helping to grow jobs in the state over the past six years. 'Sub. HB 554 risks undermining this progress by taking away some of those energy generation options, particularly the

very options most prized by the companies poised to create many jobs in Ohio in the coming years, such as high technology firms,' Kasich stated in a press release."

Oregon

 Oregon regulators are evaluating options for a market-based mechanism that <u>could link</u> to the California-Quebec carbon market, releasing a <u>partial draft report</u> on Nov. 21, 2016.

Pennsylvania

• On Nov. 9, 2016, A spokesman for Gov. Tom Wolf's Dept. of Environmental Protection <u>noted</u> that "Pennsylvania's carbon footprint has been shrinking rapidly due to market based decisions being made in the state's electric generating sector...It is likely that this trend will continue." He added that the DEP "will continue to seek ways to continue addressing climate change."

Washington

• Also in December, **Washington** Governor Jay Inslee <u>proposed</u> the state adopt a first-of-its-kind carbon tax of \$25 per metric ton of carbon pollution. The proposal supplements the state's innovative <u>Clean Air Rule</u>, adopted in September, which caps carbon emissions from individual polluters.

Multi-state: Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI)

• Meanwhile, the nine states comprising the **Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative** are engaged in a <u>stakeholder process</u> designed to establish new, more protective, standards for climate pollution.

Key State Planning Efforts and Progress towards Compliance

Arizona

- Arizona is "well positioned" to comply and already on track to meet interim goals
 under business as usual, according to analysis by <u>Pace Global</u>; modeling from
 <u>Arizona State University</u> similarly found that compliance was eminently feasible.
 The state is continuing to <u>convene</u> meetings to assess compliance options even
 though the Arizona Corporation Commission is challenging the rule in court.
- From <u>ClimateWire</u> (June 3, 2016): "Arizona may be able to meet U.S. EPA's Clean Power Plan standards solely with existing plans to retire coal plants and

shift to cleaner sources of energy, according to two models reviewed by state officials in recent meetings." The article quoted Advanced Energy Economy's Amanda Ormond: "Ormond said although the numbers aren't firm, they show Arizona is 'going to have a pretty easy time meeting the Clean Power Plan...There's a really big difference between the rhetoric of how difficult the Clean Power Plan's going to be to meet versus the technical discussions."

- From <u>ClimateWire</u> (June 3, 2016): "Timothy Franquist, who recently became DEQ's air quality division director after Eric Massey stepped down for a job at the Arizona Public Service Co., said political leaders and lawmakers in the state have been candid about the uncertainty of the stay. 'We don't want to overextend resources and find that the program goes away,' Franquist said of the Clean Power Plan. 'At the same time ... we don't want to fall so far behind that we have to play a lot of catch-up should the stay be lifted."
- From *ClimateWire* (May 31, 2016): "In Arizona, the Department of Environmental Quality, which has had a robust public process, has simultaneously held private meetings with a <u>technical work group</u> of utilities and a few clean energy groups and consumer and environmental advocates. Those meetings date back to August 2014." Arizona DEQ's meeting schedule can be found here.
- Arizona <u>continues to make progress</u> deploying emission reduction strategies. Apple, Inc. and major Arizona public power provider Salt River Project (SRP) finalized an agreement for SRP to purchase power from a 50 MW solar plant built by the major tech company. From AZBigMedia: "SRP is committed to working with our customers like Apple to meet their energy needs with the accelerated development of renewable resources, such as solar and geothermal, without increasing costs to our other customers," said SRP General Manager and CEO Mark Bonsall. "This opportunity is not only economical, but a powerful demonstration of how SRP can be a catalyst for economic development in the Valley."By purchasing the output of the Bonnybrooke plant, SRP will reduce the carbon footprint of the fossil fuel resources that serve its more than 1 million customers in the greater Phoenix metropolitan area.

Arkansas

• The state of Arkansas – which is litigating against the Clean Power Plan – <u>already</u> <u>reached</u> its 2030 CPP compliance target last year, thanks to declining coal use in favor of more renewables and natural gas. An in-depth <u>Arkansas Democrat-Gazette</u> article found that "low natural-gas prices" was the most common reason cited by utility leaders for the decline in coal use.

California

 California released a <u>draft</u> of its Clean Power Plan compliance plan in early August, the first state to do so. The accompanying statement (August 3, 2016):

"The Golden State is the first in the country to publish a draft blueprint for fulfilling the federal agency's mandate, aimed at cutting existing power plant emissions," said Stanley Young, spokesman for the California Air Resources Board. It's "a proof of concept for other states, to demonstrate that this is a program that can be adapted to each state and that can be set up in a way that we can form a regional association."

Colorado

- Colorado Gov. Hickenlooper is drafting an executive order to cut state power sector emissions by at least 35 percent by 2030. From the <u>Denver Post</u>: "Hickenlooper's been mulling this order for a while and told The Denver Post he's convinced a 35 percent cut, or better, below 2012 carbon dioxide pollution levels can be made by working with utilities, listening to them, prodding a bit, yet without increasing energy costs. ... 'We think we can go beyond what that Clean Power Plan said. We think we can be more ambitious. But cost matters,' Hickenlooper said. '...And yet we want to see how much cleaner air we can get. Can we get to 35 percent? Can we get to 36 percent? To 37? That's where we are now, working through that process."
- Xcel Energy continues to make progress on the decarbonization of their Colorado system, working to gain approval from the Colorado PUC for a proposal to integrate an additional 600 MWs of wind energy on their system. Xcel announced it reached a settlement with 11 other stakeholders in the PUC proceeding to support the Rush Creek wind farm. David Eves, President of the Colorado division of Xcel Energy, said the Rush Creek wind farm "will provide low-cost energy to our customers, and it adds a clean, renewable generation resource to the state that will help us meet potential federal and state air quality mandates."
- Colorado electric cooperative Tri-state Generation will shut down two coal plants with 527 megawatts of generating capacity by 2022 and 2025, respectively, and install pollution controls on two others in order to meet their existing regional haze obligations under the Clean Air Act. The Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment estimates the agreement will "cut carbon dioxide emissions by up to 4 million tons per year, and eliminate thousands of tons of other pollutants. Those reductions are needed to achieve compliance with state and federal clean air plans and to improve air quality in once pristine parts of the state now suffering big reductions in visibility."

Georgia

• Sheree Kernizan, Electric Unit Director for the <u>Georgia PSC</u> (April 26, 2016): "We were already on track under the proposed rules to kind of meet the [Clean Power Plan] goals anyway -- without doing anything -- and this was prior to the 2016 [integrated resource plan] that was filed this year," Kernizan said. "And [Georgia Power Company's] talking about adding more renewables, continuing the energy efficiency programs that have been in place."

Illinois

- Illinois Attorney General <u>Lisa Madigan</u> (March 29, 2016): "Taking additional steps to reduce carbon pollution will keep us moving toward cleaner air, a healthier environment, and more affordable energy. I look forward to continuing to work with other states to advance the Clean Power Plan, as well as to advocate for a comprehensive portfolio of renewable energy sources and enhancements to energy efficiency programs."
- The Clean Power Plan listening sessions remain "in the works," said Ann McCabe of the Illinois Commerce Commission (February 12, 2016 news article).

Iowa

• Iowa's utility regulator <u>recently approved</u> a massive \$3.6 billion, 2000 megawatt wind project proposed by power company MidAmerican energy.

From a MidAmerican <u>press release</u>: "We have a bold vision for our energy future,' said Bill Fehrman, CEO and president of MidAmerican Energy. 'We don't know of another U.S. energy provider that has staked out this 100 percent position. Our customers want more renewable energy, and we couldn't agree more. Once the project is complete, we will generate wind energy equal to 85 percent of our annual customer sales in Iowa, bringing us within striking distance of our 100 percent renewable vision."

Louisiana

 April 13, 2016 <u>news article</u> on Louisiana Clean Power Plan efforts: Louisiana Department of Environmental Quality's Secretary Chuck Carr Brown: "Some of the coal states are saying, 'Put your pencils down'... I took this as an opportunity to sharpen the pencil -- to create something that is going to work for the state of Louisiana."

"Regardless what happens, I feel that EPA has already been successful in that now everybody is talking about carbon emissions and addressing them," Brown said, adding later, "I don't think there's anybody out there that doesn't believe climate change is real -- if they do, I don't know where they've been." Any plan Louisiana develops "is going to be right for the state of Louisiana," Brown argued, saying that plan aims to include an "advantageous [carbon] trading component... A lot of folks are looking at what we do in Louisiana. We have a red state and a moderate Democratic governor [and] a new director. If we can get it right, so can everybody else, whatever that plan is."

Massachusetts

• Gov. Charlie Baker recently signed an <u>executive order</u> to ensure the state follows through on its ambitious climate change commitments. The Order establishes an "integrated climate change strategy" to help Massachusetts meet its goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions 25% by 2020, and 80% by 2050 over 1990 levels. Among other provisions, the Order calls for setting of interim goals for 2030 and 2040, prioritizes energy efficiency, and focuses attention on transportation sector emissions. (*UtilityDive*)

Michigan

- Even in 2015, the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality stated that the state can comply with the federal Clean Power Plan to reduce carbon emissions without changing anything until at least 2025.
- While Michigan's Attorney General is fighting the Clean Power Plan in court, the state "would be largely in compliance" with the rule under expected "business as usual" conditions, according to a recent report by the Electric Power Research Institute.
- Michigan is among the states challenging EPA in court, but Republican Gov. Rick Snyder has taken some steps to plan for compliance in the event the rule survives. In September 2016, Michigan energy officials released two reports (here and here) concluding that several low-cost compliance pathways are available to the state. "Putting these two modeling efforts together provide Michigan useful information regarding the choices we will have to make over the next two decades whether or not the federal carbon rule for clean air is put into place," Michigan Public Service Commission Chairman Sally Talberg, a Snyder appointee, said in a statement.

Minnesota

• Minnesota is continuing to develop its CPP implementation plan, even though the rule has been stayed. A <u>letter to the Minnesota state legislature</u> from the agency responsible for implementing the CPP in Minnesota explains why: "The health and longevity of our citizens is by far the most important reason for continuing our work. ... Continued implementation of a state Clear Power Plan

will reduce fossil fuel emissions – helping to keep Minnesotans healthier and reduce medical costs. ... Minnesota is doing what Governor Mark Dayton has declared to be the best action: Stay the course. Regardless of the court ruling, one thing is certain: the movement toward lower carbon emissions in Minnesota's energy sector will continue. It is consistent and driven by goals set forth in state law and is growing jobs in Minnesota – more than 15,000 to date. ... Slowing our work now, while litigators argue, goes against our commitment to work for a better, healthier Minnesota."

- Minnesota Releases Policy Blueprint: Minnesota's Environmental Quality Board (EQB) also released the Climate Solutions and Economic Opportunities (CSEO) report in partnership with The Center for Climate Strategies tto serve as a foundation for state climate action planning to achieve the state's greenhouse gas emission reduction goals. With almost a dozen state agencies, the Dayton Administration committed to leaning in to meet the 2025 reduction targets. The report is available here.
- From *EnergyWire*: Minneapolis-based utility Xcel Energy recently announced plans to build 1,500 MW of wind energy across the Upper Midwest, including in Minnesota—a \$2 billion project. The project would advance Xcel's goal of doubling its renewable portfolio by 2030. "Clearly, wind is on sale right now," an Xcel executive said. "This is one big step in a very big plan through 2030."

Nevada

- Governor Sandoval remains <u>"focused"</u> on finding a uniquely Nevada policy solution for clean and renewable energy through the work of the recently reconvened New Energy Industry Task Force that centers around the tenets laid out in the bipartisan Clean Energy Accord that he signed with 16 other governors..." The Task Force is set to make final recommendations to the Governor at the end of September.
- Clean energy investments continue to move forward in Nevada. The Interior Department formally approved a utility-scale solar project in southern Nevada. The 100 MW Aiya Solar Project, which has the capacity to produce enough electricity to power 25,000 homes, will help Nevada power company NV Energy offset the power generated by the Reid Gardner coal plant and will limit plant operation water use up to 1.6 million gallons per year. NV Energy also recently announced plans to transition the final unit at Reid Gardner (250 megawatts) 10 months earlier than expected. NV Energy plans to replace the lost capacity with a 100 megawatt solar project and new natural gas generation.

"NV Energy's Senior Vice President of Energy Supply Kevin Geraghty said of the new solar project, 'At an average cost of energy for the life of the project at approximately four cents per kilowatt-hour, this is one of the lowest-cost solar projects in the nation."

North Dakota

 Electric cooperative Great River Energy <u>closed</u> a 189 MW coal-fired power plant in July 2016 after concluding the plant was no longer economic. Great River <u>said</u> <u>they plan to</u> "meet future demand for energy with conservation, energy efficiency, renewable energy, natural gas and market purchases."

Ohio

• Ohio utility FirstEnergy <u>will close five coal-fired generating units</u> by 2020, totaling 856 megawatts of generating capacity. Said FirstEnergy Generation president Jim Lash: "Continued challenging market conditions have made it increasingly difficult for smaller units like Bay Shore and Sammis Units 1-4 to be competitive. It's no longer economically viable to operate these facilities."

Pennsylvania

- From NPR's <u>StateImpact</u> (Nov. 9, 2016): "The state Department of Environmental Protection <u>had previously said it would continue work on the Clean Power Plan</u> despite the ongoing court battle. ... 'Regardless of the ultimate outcome,' [said DEP spokesman Neil Shader,] 'Pennsylvania's carbon footprint has been shrinking rapidly due to market based decisions being made in the state's electric generating sector, particularly rapid switching toward natural gas. It is likely that this trend will continue. DEP will continue to seek ways to continue addressing climate change."
- From *NPR*'s <u>StateImpact</u>: Pennsylvania is continuing to work on the Clean Power Plan. "It just makes good business sense to continue to plan for what we know is going to happen. This is inevitable," says [Dept. of Env. Protection (DEP) head John] Quigley. "It's smart for Pennsylvania if we're going to maintain our role as an energy exporter and maintain the role of our energy economy."
- From <u>EnergyWire</u>: Even with the Clean Power Plan stayed, Pennsylvania's PUC is still working with the DEP and regional grid operator PJM to plan for compliance. "I know things appear to have slowed down because of the court challenge,' said Gladys Brown, chairwoman of the Public Utility Commission. But that's just appearances, she said in an interview." The PUC has dedicated four staff members to work with the DEP towards a compliance plan.
- <u>Analysis</u> by Georgia Institute of Technology shows that Pennsylvania households will *save* money on electricity bills---by 6.7%---under the least-cost CPP compliance pathway.
- From <u>Law360</u>: PJM, which operates the grid for Pennsylvania and 12 other states, analyzed Clean Power Plan compliance options at the requests of its member states, including Pennsylvania. The operator found "The CO2 emissions reduction goals of the Clean Power Plan can be achieved within the PJM footprint

under each of the seven compliance pathways studied. ... Regardless of the compliance pathway, resource adequacy is maintained in the PJM footprint."

South Carolina

- From a February 11 <u>news article</u>: "But some states, more aggressive in their carbon reduction work, say they will continue with their efforts regardless of the case's outcome. South Carolina has indicated it expects to continue work to decarbonize the state's power industry, an effort which began two years ago."
- From <u>The New York Times</u>, July 19, 2016: "But South Carolina regulators are moving forward with meetings on a new state energy plan which, Mr. Scott conceded, will probably include discussion of how to reduce emissions from electric power plants. It will just not be called the Clean Power Plan.

'We're still working on clean air, just not pursuant to the Clean Power Plan,' Mr. Scott said. He added that if the Clean Power Plan was upheld by the courts, South Carolina's work on an energy plan that includes lower emissions from power plants could be repurposed in its work to comply with the climate plan."

Washington

- Washington has <u>continued to move ahead</u> with its multi-sector carbon reduction strategy, releasing a new Clean Air Rule that sets individual caps for the state's largest sources of carbon emissions. The Rule requires the state's largest sources to decrease their emissions by an average of 1.7 percent annually. Over time, the rule will expand to cover a greater number of sources and require deeper emission reductions.
- The <u>Clean Air Rule</u> moves Washington closer to achieving its state greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets, and aims to help the state achieve greater reductions than the Clean Power Plan would require. In addition, Washington officials indicate the rule is designed to allow power plants that are also subject to the Clean Power Plan to readily navigate both regulatory frameworks.

Wyoming:

- From a February 13, 2016 <u>news article</u>: "[Governor] Mead, in an interview Friday, said Wyoming would continue to oppose the rules in court...The Cowboy State nevertheless will continue compliance planning, albeit at a slower pace, he said.
- "State Sen. Michael Von Flatern, a Gillette Republican who chairs the powerful Senate Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee, voiced support Friday for continued planning. 'Whatever the court decides and our

- neighboring states and our receiving states choose, Wyoming should be prepared,' he said."
- The New York Times (July 19, 2016) reported Wyoming is moving forward with efforts to comply with the Clean Power Plan. The Times quoted Governor Mead: "Obviously we're suing and going to fight,' Mr. Mead, a former United States attorney for Wyoming, said in an interview in his office here. 'But from my court experience, I know you have to prepare not to win."

Multi-state: Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative

• The nine Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) states (Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, New York, Rhode Island, and Vermont) are already on track to hit CPP compliance goals <u>a decade early</u> [Figure 5, p. 8], if 2020 RGGI targets simply flatline through 2030.

RGGI states are <u>considering</u> going far beyond CPP requirements by implementing more stringent targets. Regulators are weighing proposals to lower targets an additional 2.5% or 5% per year from 2020 through 2030.

* * *

Statements in Response to the Supreme Court Stay

Arizona

• Eric Massey of <u>Arizona Department of Environmental Quality</u> quote (February 11, 2016): "...the state will continue gathering information while the court considers the Clean Power Plan. By March the division is expecting to complete a baseline outlook for 15 years of carbon emissions given impending changes including APS fuel conversions, growth in renewable energy and energy efficiency."

California

- Governor Brown statement on the Supreme Court's stay order (February 9, 2016): "As the world gets hotter and closer to irreversible climate change, these justices appear tone-deaf as they fiddle with procedural niceties. This arbitrary roadblock does incalculable damage and undermines America's climate leadership. But make no mistake, this won't stop California from continuing to do its part under the Clean Power Plan."
- Attorney General Kamala Harris statement on the Supreme Court's stay order (February 9, 2016): "I am extremely disappointed by the Supreme Court's decision today to block President Obama's Clean Power Plan," said Attorney General Harris. "The Court's decision, and the special interests working to undermine this plan, threatens our environment, public health and economy."

Colorado

- <u>Governor Hickenlooper</u> quote (April 7, 2016): "Our full intention is to get to, and in many cases exceed, what the goals are in the Clean Power Plan... The focus of [Colorado Public Health and Environment Department] and this state is to get to cleaner air in real time."
 - "Our goal is to get to much cleaner standards and probably achieve or exceed what's in the Clean Power Plan... our goal here is to get cleaner air without really any negative impact to the ratepayer's pocketbooks."
- Governor Hickenlooper statement (February 10, 2016): "While we're still reviewing the implications of the Supreme Court's decision, we remain committed to having the cleanest air in the nation. We'll continue to build upon the great strides we've made as a state with the Clean Air Clean Jobs Act and our Renewable Energy Standard to protect our public health and environment."
- CO Department of Public Health & Environment statement (February 11, 2016): "It is prudent for Colorado to move forward during the litigation to ensure that the state is not left at a disadvantage if the courts uphold all or part of the Clean Power Plan. Because the Supreme Court did not say whether the stay would change the rule's compliance deadlines, Colorado could lose valuable time if it delays its work on the state plan and the rule is ultimately upheld."

Connecticut

- Governor Dannel Malloy statement (February 10, 2016): "I believe in science the data is real. Global warming is happening. Urgent action is needed on a national and an international basis to combat it. That's why the Supreme Court's ruling to pause implementation of the Clean Power Plan is disappointing and shortsighted. However, it is not a final decision on the legal merits of the Clean Power Plan, so it is important that we continue with preparations for compliance with the plan while these issues are being worked out in the courts.
 - "Connecticut is already a national leader on global warming and that will not change. We're going to continue to cut carbon in a cost-effective, reliable manner while growing a clean energy economy. Through programs like the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, we already have achieved significant reductions in carbon pollution from the electric sector, while growing our economies and maintaining reliable power. We have an obligation to combat greenhouse gases, and Connecticut is going to continue to do just that."
- The ruling "changes but does not end the need for conversation [among states],"
 <u>said</u> Jack Betkoski, Vice-Chair of the Connecticut Public Utilities Regulatory
 Authority and second vice president of NARUC (February 12, 2016).

Delaware

• Governor Jack Markell (via Facebook February 11, 2016): "I am disappointed in yesterday's Supreme Court action on the EPA Clean Power Plan, but optimistic that it will be upheld when the courts review the merits of the case. We remain determined to move forward in responding to the issue of climate change. As a RGGI state, Delaware has led the country in working to curtail greenhouse gas emissions from the power sector, and we will continue to do so regardless of the decision to stay the Clean Power Plan rule. As a coastal state, we are acutely aware of the serious threats of climate change and sea level rise, and the Clean Power Plan represents a sensible and flexible approach for states to make the changes required to protect our economy and quality of life."

Idaho

 "The <u>Idaho DEQ</u> will continue to work with the Office of Energy Resources and the Idaho Public Utilities Commission to determine the best options for the state if the rule is reinstated. Meanwhile, technical analysis of the rule and its impacts will continue and, 'as time allows, we will continue discussions with affected utilities and surrounding states,' the Idaho DEQ said."

Iowa

• From a February 12, 2016 <u>news article</u>: The Iowa DNR plans to move forward with a previously scheduled Clean Power Plan stakeholder meeting on February 22. In the <u>meeting announcement</u>, the Iowa Department of Natural Resources stated "...DNR would like to work collaboratively with stakeholders to analyze our next steps. To that end, we will still have the February 22nd stakeholder meeting as scheduled. The agenda for the meeting is attached and includes time to hear your thoughts on next steps and focus on EM&V. Given the judicial uncertainty of the rule, hearing from stakeholders on the way forward is very important."

Maine

Attorney General <u>Janet Mills</u> statement on tackling climate change (March 29, 2016): "Our natural resources are the lifeblood of our state's economy and our quality of life. Global climate change demands immediate action and I am committed to using the authority of my office to address the problem in a meaningful way by defending important EPA regulations against attacks led by the coal industry and exploring litigation options that will hold the worst polluters accountable for their actions."

Massachusetts

- Attorney General Maura Healey (February 10, 2016): "Although we are disappointed with the Supreme Court's decision to delay implementation of the EPA's Clean Power Plan, we believe the courts will uphold this program after full consideration of the merits of the case. Massachusetts has made important progress on addressing the threat of climate change, and as this case proceeds we will work with our coalition of states and local governments to continue to defend the Clean Power Plan's reasonable, flexible and cost effective approach to lowering the greenhouse gas emissions of our country's power plants."
- "Based on our review, the Commonwealth, as part of the nine-state Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI), is well positioned to meet the goals of the federal Clean Power Plan," a spokeswoman for the Massachusetts Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs told Bloomberg BNA in an e-mail.
 - From Bloomberg BNA: States Respond to Clean Power Plan Stay (Childers)

Minnesota

- Governor Mark Dayton statement (February 10, 2016): "While the Court's temporary stay is disappointing, it does nothing to diminish our resolve in Minnesota to keep moving forward on clean energy initiatives, including the development of our state's Clean Power Plan. President Obama's strong leadership, the nation-leading initiatives of some of our state's utilities, and my administration's commitment will assure our state's continued progress.
 - "We shouldn't need a federal edict to understand how vital it is that we keep doing everything in our collective powers to reduce harmful greenhouse gas emissions, improve energy efficiency, and advance Minnesota's clean energy economy."
- Minnesota Pollution Control Agency (<u>via Twitter</u>, February 10, 2016):
 "CleanPowerPlanMN is moving forward attend our listening session in Bemidji next week."
- News article, February 12, 2016, Court stay may slow, not stop, state carbon-cutting talks: "Some state officials proclaimed they would nonetheless plow ahead with planning until a final court decision. 'We will go full speed ahead,' said David Thornton, assistant commissioner of the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency."

Nevada:

• <u>Governor Brian Sandoval</u> statement on reconvening the New Energy Industry Task Force (February 23, 2016): "Nevada was already well on the road to

compliance with proposed federal regulations concerning carbon emission rate reductions," said Sandoval. "That rule is now under scrutiny by the U.S. Supreme Court. This task force will work with the Nevada Division of Environmental Protection and other stakeholders to determine the best path forward for our state, a uniquely Nevadan solution that balances energy efficiency, economic development, and environmental stewardship. The Task Force will be making recommendations for the state to consider with regard to future EPA compliance issues, but more importantly to do the right thing for the people of Nevada."

• Governor Sandoval's office on the Clean Power Plan litigation (February 25, 2016): "The Governor did not request the filing of an amicus brief in the Clean Power Plan case. In taking this action, the Attorney General is simply offering his legal opinion. The Governor is focused on finding a uniquely Nevada policy solution for clean and renewable energy through the work of the recently reconvened New Energy Industry Task Force that centers around the tenets laid out in the bipartisan Clean Energy Accord that he signed with 16 other governors last week."

New Hampshire

• Governor Maggie Hassan (February 10, 2016): "New Hampshire has long led efforts to cut carbon emissions and combat climate change so that we can have the cleaner and safer environment that our people need to live healthy, productive lives – and it's crucial that other states follow our lead and take responsibility for the pollution that they cause. Through programs such as the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, our region is showing that it is possible to protect public health, spur energy innovation, and promote affordable, reliable energy sources for our economy. That's why I have been a strong supporter of the Clean Power Plan, and the Supreme Court's decision to delay this important step forward is very disappointing."

New Mexico

• <u>NM Environment Secretary Ryan Flynn</u> said in a statement that "despite capricious political winds, the New Mexico Environment Department remains committed to taking meaningful action to reduce greenhouse gases by a projected 5.7 million tons by the end of 2017."

New York

• AG Eric Schneiderman + Joint Statement of States and Counties* (February 10, 2016): "We are confident that once the courts have fully reviewed the merits of the Clean Power Plan, it will be upheld as lawful under the Clean Air Act. Our coalition of states and local governments will continue to vigorously defend the Clean Power Plan —which is critical to ensuring that necessary progress is made

in confronting climate change."

- *Additional states and cities: California, Connecticut, Hawaii, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, New Mexico, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, the District of Columbia, the cities of New York, Boulder, Chicago, Philadelphia, South Miami and Broward County, Florida.
- Governor Andrew Cuomo <u>quote</u> (February 10, 2016): "New York State remains committed to moving forward with our own actions to protect the environment and the public health. But this issue requires a global response and the Clean Power Plan is crucial to ensuring a cleaner, greener, and safer future for all."

Oregon

• Governor Kate Brown (via Facebook, February 10, 2016): "Even though the Clean Power Plan is going through a battle in the courts, Oregon has been and continues to be committed to national efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from the power sector. Oregon is well-positioned to comply with the EPA targets because there have already been early actions in Oregon through investments in energy efficiency, renewable energy development, and moving away from coal."

Pennsylvania

- <u>DEP Secretary John Quigley</u> quote (February 11, 2016): "The rule's in effect, the rule hasn't gone away. We, at least currently, see a path to submitting [a state plan] on Sept. 6... It's clear that renewables are the future. What the Clean Power Plan is calling for is really good business."
- Governor Wolf's spokesman Jeff Sheridan quote (February 10, 2016): "Pennsylvania will continue planning and engagement with stakeholders on the Clean Power Plan, pending final decision of this issue by the Supreme Court. We will continue to closely monitor the ongoing legal process."

Vermont

• Governor Peter Shumlin statement (February 10, 2016): "This is incredibly disappointing news. The forces fighting President Obama's common sense plan are those with a stake in the dirty energy status quo that is of polluting our air, water, and forests and contributing to global climate change. Their desperate attempt to make a profit at the expense of our health and the future of the planet is standing in the way of serious action to combat climate change and preserve a livable planet for future generations.

"It is no surprise that the suit over the Clean Power Plan was brought by proponents of the coal industry. That industry, and those who support it, will do everything they can to boost their profits, even if it means imperiling our planet's future. This is just one more example why Vermont should not be in the business of supporting the coal industry and should divest from coal stocks."

Virginia

• Governor McAuliffe statement (February 10, 2016): "Over the last several months my administration has been working with a diverse group of Virginia stakeholders that includes members of the environmental, business, and energy communities to develop a strong, viable path forward to comply with the Clean Power Plan. As this court case moves forward, we will stay on course and continue to develop the elements for a Virginia plan to reduce carbon emissions and stimulate our clean energy economy."

Washington

• Governor Inslee statement (February 10, 2016): "Yesterday's Supreme Court ruling on the Clean Power Plan is very troubling, surprising, and disappointing. And it inexplicably breaks with past rulings in which the high court has called for federal rules to limit the carbon pollution that is driving climate change.

"We cannot afford to wait any longer for federal action to address carbon pollution and transition to clean energy. Here in Washington state we are unfortunately already seeing the harmful impacts of climate change, and we will continue to take steps that reduce carbon and to lead the nation in clean energy. The EPA's Clean Power Plan remains a crucial tool to ensure that every state must do its part, and to empower them to do so."