

State Momentum Continues for America's Clean Energy Future & Climate Progress

U.S. governors and mayors are strengthening their commitment to reduce carbon pollution, transition to clean energy, and address climate change in the face of the Trump administration's efforts to roll back vital public health and climate safeguards.

A bipartisan group of elected officials and policymakers — from <u>mayors and members of Congress</u> to <u>more than a dozen state energy and environmental regulators</u> — vigorously oppose EPA Administrator Pruitt's misguided effort to repeal the Clean Power Plan. They highlight subnational leadership to cut carbon pollution and shift to clean energy in order to mitigate the threat of climate change.

<u>At least 18 governors</u> — including at least four Republicans — and <u>more than 400</u> <u>mayors</u> spoke out against President Trump's June 2017 decision to withdraw the U.S. from the Paris Agreement. In March 2017, Trump's executive order initiating rollbacks of the Clean Power Plan and other important federal climate protections also <u>prompted dozens of governors and mayors to respond</u> in support of continued clean energy progress.

Meanwhile, state and local officials continue to take ever-stronger action towards a low-carbon future. Sixteen states plus Puerto Rico are now part of the <u>U.S. Climate Alliance</u>, a compact of states that have pledged to meet the U.S. goals under the Paris Agreement. Governors across the political spectrum, from <u>California</u> to <u>Colorado</u>, <u>Illinois</u>, <u>New Jersey</u>, <u>Virginia</u>, and more are taking concrete action to achieve deep reductions in carbon emissions from the power sector.

Meaningful federal actions to reduce carbon pollution remain essential to effectively mitigating climate change. In the meantime, the leadership of a growing group of states and cities demonstrates that climate progress and shared prosperity go hand in hand. The clean energy transformation is well underway.

Subnational Leadership Continues Despite Trump Rollbacks

As the Trump Administration and EPA Administrator Scott Pruitt undertake misguided and reckless efforts to repeal the Clean Power Plan and rollback other critical federal climate protections, states and cities are moving full steam ahead to fulfill ambitious commitments to further climate progress and a clean energy transformation.

Alaska

 Alaska Governor Bill Walker (I) <u>signed an order</u> in October 2017 establishing an advisory team to propose actions, including "statutory and regulatory changes," for the state to reduce carbon pollution and support the goals of the Paris Agreement.

Maryland

- In a show of bipartisan commitment to ambitious climate action, Maryland joined the U.S. Climate Alliance a compact of sixteen states plus Puerto Rico committed to upholding the goals of the Paris Agreement in January 2018.
- Maryland has also remained committed to the bipartisan Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) — a multi-state program to cost-effectively reduce carbon pollution from the power sector across the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic. "Maryland is committed to finding real bipartisan, common sense solutions to protect our environment, combat climate change, and improve our air quality," <u>said</u> Governor Larry Hogan. "By working together, we are showing that it is possible to find consensus to protect our natural resources, promote clean energy, and grow our economy for current and future generations."

New Jersey

- In April 2018, New Jersey <u>passed into law a sweeping new package of clean energy bills</u> that will grow the clean energy economy and reduce carbon pollution by 350,000 metric tons each year. The package sets New Jersey on a path to meet 50 percent of its electricity from renewable sources by 2030 and establishes a new community solar program that will expand clean energy access for low- and moderate-income families.
- In January 2018, Governor Phil Murphy <u>signed an executive order</u> directing New Jersey regulators to begin the process of rejoining RGGI. "With this Executive Order, New Jersey takes the first step toward restoring our place as a leader in the green economy," Gov. Murphy said.
- In February 2018, Governor Murphy also <u>signed an order adding</u> New Jersey to the U.S. Climate Alliance of states committed to upholding the Paris Agreement goals. The Governor has <u>outlined a goal</u> of powering New Jersey with 100 percent clean energy by mid-century.

<u>Virginia</u>

• Virginia regulators are <u>working to advance</u> a rule to limit carbon pollution from Virginia's power sector and link the state with RGGI. The proposed regulation would reduce carbon emissions from the state's power plants by 30% from 2020 to 2030.

Regional Efforts

In December 2017, the nine states in the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative

 Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New
 Hampshire, New York, Rhode Island, and Vermont — solidified a proposal to reduce carbon pollution from power plants by an additional 30 percent between 2020 and 2030. The new agreement demonstrates continued

bipartisan commitment to cost-effectively cutting climate pollution in the Northeast.

- Sixteen states plus Puerto Rico are now part of the <u>U.S. Climate Alliance</u>

 a bipartisan compact of U.S. governors committed to upholding the goals of the Paris Agreement by reducing greenhouse gas emissions by at least 26-28% by 2025 from 2005 levels. The Alliance members <u>account</u> for more than 10% of U.S. power sector carbon emissions. Most recently, **Maryland** and **New Jersey** joined the Alliance in early 2018.
- In April 2018, environmental and energy regulators from **thirteen states California**, **Colorado**, **Connecticut**, **Delaware**, **Massachusetts**, **Minnesota**, **New York**, **North Carolina**, **Oregon**, **Rhode Island**, **Vermont**, **Virginia**, **and Washington** <u>delivered a letter</u> to Administrator Pruitt opposing repeal of the Clean Power Plan and highlighting important progress across states to reduce carbon pollution from the power sector. "Low natural gas prices, declining costs of renewable energy technologies, and low demand growth are all existing power sector trends that have allowed our states to reap positive economic benefits from reducing emissions. The CPP would amplify these trends and make emissions reductions easier and more costeffective," the states write in the letter.
- As of June 2017, more than 250 U.S. mayors have committed to procure 100% renewable energy for their cities by 2035. "We are showing the world that cities and mayors can and will lead the transition away from fossil fuels to 100 percent clean, renewable energy," said Mayor Steve Benjamin of Columbia, South Carolina. "There is more work to be done to realize this vision for our nation, but this vote represents an important first step towards cleaner air and water for our families, more good-paying jobs in clean energy, and stronger cities across the country."
- At least 20 states and the District of Columbia have adopted ambitious greenhouse gas reduction targets, with most aiming for an 80 percent reduction by 2050 below baselines ranging from 1990 to 2006. Twenty-nine states and D.C. have binding renewable portfolio standards in place, while eight more have set renewable portfolio goals. Twenty states have set mandatory energy efficiency targets, while eight more have set energy efficiency goals.

State & Local Officials Oppose Trump's Paris Withdrawal

Quickly following President Trump's June 1, 2017 decision to initiate U.S. withdrawal from the Paris Agreement, governors and mayors across the country spoke out against this latest attack on global climate action, and vowed to continue moving towards a low-carbon future.

California

• <u>Gov. Jerry Brown</u> (<u>Los Angeles Times</u>): "Here we are, in 2017, going backwards, It cannot stand, it's not right and California will do everything it can to not only

- stay the course, but to build more support in other states, in other provinces, in other countries.
- <u>Gov. Jerry Brown (*E&E News*</u>): "The complexity and scope of climate issues calls out for federal leadership and federal rules and laws. It can't make up for it, but California and other states and other countries can hold the line and advance the ball while we suffer this interregnum of climate denial."
- Gov. Jerry Brown (joint statement with governors of **New York** and **Washington** on formation of **United States Climate Alliance**): "If the President is going to be AWOL in this profoundly important human endeavor, then California and other states will step up."

Colorado

- <u>Gov. John Hickenlooper</u> (<u>statement</u>): "It is a serious mistake to back out of the Paris Accord. This is a historic global agreement between almost every nation on earth to address the single most pressing issue facing humanity...Colorado's commitment to clean air and clean energy will continue."
- Gov. John Hickenlooper (*E&E News*): "We are going to continue to move for cleaner air at the same or less cost... Mark my words, we're going to see an evolution to governors playing a stronger role in energy and governors working together at a level we have not seen before. When the federal government abandons its leadership on a specific issue, I think states have an obligation to their citizens to step up."

Connecticut

• Gov. Dan Malloy (via Twitter): "Withdrawing the United States from the Paris Agreement is a grave mistake – and it is our future generations who will pay the price... For our part, in Connecticut we will continue building on our efforts to address climate change with common sense, practical initiatives that will help to build and grow our economy."

Delaware

• Gov. John Carney (statement): "I am deeply disappointed that President Trump has chosen to withdraw the United States from the Paris Agreement that united nations across the globe in a fight against climate change. Already the effects of climate change are taking a toll on Delawareans...These threats will only increase."

District of Columbia

Mayor Muriel Bowser (statement): "Washington, DC will continue to work with cities and countries around the globe to meet the goals of the Paris Agreement."
 "At a time when our country should be leading the fight against climate change, it is disappointing to see us retreating into isolation. Fortunately, I am confident

that leaders around the country will continue to think globally, act locally, and ensure that the U.S. remains a strong partner in the fight against climate change."

Hawaii

• Gov. David Ige (statement): "Hawai'i and other Pacific Islands are already experiencing the impact of rising sea levels and natural disasters. That's why my administration and the Legislature are already taking concrete steps to implement the Paris Accord."

Maryland

• Spokeswoman for <u>Gov. Larry Hogan (R)</u> (<u>Baltimore Sun</u>): "Governor Hogan remains committed to preserving Maryland's natural resources for future generations."

Massachusetts

- Gov. Charlie Baker (R) (via Twitter): "Despite today's announcement, Massachusetts is aggressively working to exceed the goals of the Paris Agreement on the state level, while growing our economy through clean energy innovation and environmental stewardship. In Massachusetts and around the world, climate change is a shared reality and our ability to rise and respond to this challenge will shape future generations."
- Gov. Charlie Baker (R) (*E&E News*): "A decision by the Trump-Pence Administration to not maintain the United States' commitment to the Paris Climate Agreement would be disappointing and counterproductive to the efforts and progress Massachusetts and other states have made to reduce carbon emissions."

Minnesota

• <u>Gov. Mark Dayton</u> (<u>statement</u>): "President Trump's decision to withdraw the United States from the Paris Climate Change Agreement is terrible for our state, nation, and world...As damaging as this decision will be, it will not deter our efforts here in Minnesota."

Montana

• <u>Gov. Steve Bullock</u> (<u>via Facebook</u>): "Ask any Montana farmer, rancher, hunter, angler, or skier – climate change is real and poses a threat to our economy and way of life. To not acknowledge that or deal with it in a responsible way is short-sighted and dangerous.

"In Montana, and in America, we face our challenges head on and work together to find solutions. We do not run away from them or pretend they don't exist."

New York

- <u>Gov. Andrew Cuomo</u> (<u>via Facebook</u>): "Withdrawing from the Paris Accord is reckless. I'm signing an Executive Order affirming New York State's role in fighting climate change. New York is committed to meeting the standards set forth in the Paris Accord regardless of Washington's irresponsible actions."
- Gov. Andrew Cuomo (joint statement with governors of **California** and **Washington** on formation of <u>United States Climate Alliance</u>): "The White House's reckless decision to withdraw from the Paris Climate Agreement has devastating repercussions not only for the United States, but for our planet...I am also signing an Executive Order confirming New York's leadership role in protecting our citizens, our environment, and our planet."

North Carolina

• <u>Gov. Roy Cooper</u> (<u>AP</u>): "North Carolina's commitment to clean air and a healthy environment will remain a priority despite the lack of forward thinking leadership from the current Administration."

Ohio

• Gov. John Kasich (R) (via Twitter): "I share concerns many have voiced about flaws in the Paris climate agreement. I'm convinced we can correct them and improve the agreement, however, by showing leadership and constructively engaging with like-minded nations, not by joining the ranks of holdouts like Syria and Nicaragua."

Oregon

• Gov. Kate Brown (statement): "Oregon has a strong tradition of fighting climate change, and we will not back down. "It is irresponsible for the president to deny these real-world implications. While Oregon is a small state, we can play a huge role in finding innovative solutions to preserve our natural resources, reduce carbon, and create a cleaner, and greener energy mix of the future."

Pennsylvania

• Gov. Tom Wolf (statement): "I urge President Trump not to abdicate the United States' global leadership and seat at the table on climate change...We cannot ignore the scientific evidence and economic significance of climate change and put our economy and population at risk."

Rhode Island

• <u>Gov. Gina Raimondo</u> (<u>via Twitter</u>): "Republicans and Democrats alike recognize that the Paris Agreement is about so much more than climate change. It's about opportunity, stewardship and America's standing as a global leader. President Trump's action will not deter Rhode Island from taking necessary steps to address climate change."

Vermont

• <u>Gov. Phil Scott (R)</u> (<u>statement</u>): "Vermont has taken a leadership role in addressing climate change, and the President's decision today only strengthens our commitment...We will continue to do our share in a way that creates jobs, makes our state more affordable for families and businesses, and protects our environment for future generations."

Virginia

• <u>Gov. Terry McAuliffe</u> (<u>statement</u>): "Climate change is a threat to our way of life. If President Trump refuses to lead the response, Virginia will...I hope states around the country join Virginia in showing Washington the way forward on this critical issue for our nation and our world."

Washington

- <u>Gov. Jay Inslee</u> (<u>statement</u>): "Washington State is leading the way on climate issues where Washington, D.C., is failing...We are also partnering with other states who are doing the same, and our states will not stop fighting for a clean energy future, regardless of who is in the White House.
- <u>Gov. Jay Inslee</u> (<u>joint statement</u> with mayors of **California** and **New York** on formation of United States Climate Alliance): "I am proud to stand with other governors as we make sure that the inaction in D.C. is met by an equal force of action from the states."

Joint Statements

- <u>US Climate Alliance</u>: In response to the U.S. federal government's decision to withdraw the United States from the Paris Agreement on climate change, Governors Andrew Cuomo, Jay Inslee, and Jerry Brown created The United States Climate Alliance. The Alliance is committed to upholding the Paris Accord and taking aggressive action on climate change. It now includes 14 states (California, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Hawaii, Massachusetts, Minnesota, North Carolina, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, New York) and Puerto Rico.
- We are Still In: The governors of California, Connecticut, Hawaii, New York, North Carolina, Oregon, Rhode Island, Virginia, and Washington, along with the mayors of 125 cities, 902 businesses and investors, and 183 colleges and universities "declared their intent to continue to ensure the U.S. remains a global leader in reducing carbon emissions. Together, these leaders are sending a strong signal to the international community and the 194 other parties to the Paris Agreement about the continued commitment of the U.S. to ambitious action on climate change absent leadership at the federal level."
- <u>US Climate Mayors</u>: (<u>statement</u> from 381+ mayors): "We will adopt, honor, and uphold the commitments to the goals enshrined in the Paris Agreement...We will

- continue to lead...And if the President wants to break the promises made to our allies enshrined in the historic Paris Agreement, we'll build and strengthen relationships around the world to protect the planet from devastating climate risks."
- <u>State Legislators United For Climate Action</u>: over 550 state legislators from the National Caucus of Environmental Legislators from 45 states signed a <u>letter</u> opposing Trump's decision to withdraw from the Paris Agreement.

* * *

States, Cities Speak Out Against Trump Climate Order

On March 28, 2017, President Trump signed an Executive Order that directs the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency to weaken a range of important public health protections, including steps to revoke the Clean Power Plan, America's first-ever standards to reduce dangerous carbon pollution from large power plants. Immediately after the President signed the Executive Order, a broad swath of governors, mayors, and other local officials publically spoke out against Trump's attack on these vital public health safeguards.

Connecticut

• Gov. Dan Malloy (statement): "The president's latest executive order signifies a lack of leadership from Washington on climate change... I strongly believe that advancing clean energy is about advancing the success of our future...This is the approach our entire nation should be taking in order to be a leader in the global clean energy sector and produce American prosperity and jobs."

Colorado

• <u>Gov. John Hickenlooper</u> (<u>press release</u>): "Today's Executive Order by the President pulling back on policies addressing climate change will not deter Colorado's efforts...We will keep building a clean energy future that creates Colorado jobs, improves our health and addresses the harmful consequences of a changing climate."

Delaware

• <u>Gov. Jay Carney</u> (<u>quote</u>): "It's a bad idea to abandon any tools that help us combat the real effects of climate change...The safety and health of Delawareans, our economy, and our natural resources are dependent not only on our actions as a state, but on a shared, urgent commitment to reduce greenhouse gas emissions."

Minnesota

• <u>Gov. Mark Dayton</u> (<u>statement</u>): "Today's action marks the latest in a series of destructive Executive Orders from President Trump. This new order will do irreparable damage to our environment and our economy...As damaging as this executive order will be for the nation, and for the world, it will not deter our efforts here in Minnesota."

"We will share best practices with other states, and work with them to mitigate the damaging impacts of the President's dangerous and divisive policies."

New York

• New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio (statement): Climate change presents an "existential threat" to the city. "We're already experiencing rising seas and hotter weather, with the last three years on record as the hottest yet. At the same time, the effects of climate change will fall disproportionately on our most vulnerable communities, exacerbating inequality."

Pennsylvania

- Gov. Tom Wolf (statement): "Today's action by the President will do nothing to help coal communities but will exacerbate the negative impact climate change is having on our economy...My administration will continue to actively seek ways to reduce the impact of climate change on our citizens and businesses."
- Pennsylvania Dept. of Environmental Protection Acting Secretary Patrick

 McDonnell (statement): "Pennsylvania has already experienced a long-term
 warming of nearly two degrees over the past century, and this trend is expected to
 accelerate. Ignoring the problem will only make conditions worse for our
 communities and economy and environment in the future."

Virginia

• Gov. Terry McAuliffe (statement): "The actions President Trump took today threaten our environment, our security and our ability to compete in the global economy."

"Here in the Commonwealth, we will continue to confront the impacts of climate change and support clean energy investments that will grow our economy and shape our future."

Washington

• Governor Jay Inslee (statement): "President Trump's decision to ax the Clean Power Plan cedes U.S. global leadership and increases the risk that climate change will continue to damage our state. We can't afford to slow our efforts, and we won't."

Joint Statements

- <u>California Gov. Brown and New York Gov. Andrew Cuomo</u> (joint statement):
 "Dismantling the Clean Power Plan and other critical climate programs is
 profoundly misguided and shockingly ignores basic science. We stand together
 with a majority of the American people in supporting bold actions to protect our
 communities from the dire consequences of climate change."
- Governors of California, Oregon, & Washington, and mayors of Los Angeles (CA), Oakland (CA), Portland (OR), San Francisco (CA), & Seattle (WA) (joint statement): "We speak today in support of the Clean Power Plan. We speak in unified opposition to the idea of any decision by the President to limit our region's economic opportunities or our commitment to doing what's right to make our cities and states cleaner and healthier for future generations."
- Governors of California, Connecticut, Minnesota, New York, Oregon, & Washington, and mayors of New York City (NY), Oakland, Portland, Sacramento (CA), & Seattle (Under2 Coalition joint statement): "As Washington, D.C. delays, the work to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in our cities and states continues. We will not waver. And we will continue to enlist likeminded cities, states, regions and countries around the world to join this fight."
- 41 mayors, including of Atlanta (GA), Boston (MA), Chicago (IL), Columbia (SC), Durham (NC), Fayetteville (AR), Houston (TX), Knoxville (TN), Los Angeles, New Orleans (LA), New York City, Philadelphia (PA), Pittsburgh (PA), San Francisco, Seattle, & Washington, D.C (Climate Mayors joint statement): "We write to strongly object to your actions to roll back critically important U.S. climate policies including the Clean Power Plan...That is why we affirm our cities' commitments to taking every action possible to achieve the principles and goals of the Paris Climate Agreement, and to engage states, businesses and other sectors to join us." Climate Mayors now has 362 members.
- A coalition of 23 top legal officials, including 17 Attorneys General of New York, California, Connecticut, Delaware, Hawaii, Iowa, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Mexico, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, & the District of Columbia, as well as the chief legal officers of 6 cities: Boulder (CO), Chicago (IL), New York (NY), Philadelphia (PA), South Miami (FL), & Broward County (FL) (joint statement): "We strongly oppose President Trump's executive order that seeks to dismantle the Clean Power Plan...We won't hesitate to protect those we serve—including by aggressively opposing in court President Trump's actions that ignore both the law and the critical importance of confronting the very real threat of climate change."

States Continue Climate Progress Post-2016 Election

After the 2016 election, state governors have continued to affirm — and in many cases strengthen — their commitment to reducing carbon emissions, addressing climate change, and moving to a clean energy future.

Arkansas

• Arkansas Public Service Commission chairman Ted Thomas (E&E News) (Feb. 2017): "If [Congress and the Administration] don't get it together, we're going to have a different administration in four years, and that's when folks might wish they had the Clean Power Plan."

Thomas explained that most of the price risk of the federal climate rule would have come in the second half of the next decade anyway. "To me, a utility commissioner isn't doing their job, given that they make a long-term projection, if they're not including resource diversity that includes non-carbon resources."

California

- In July 2017, Gov. Jerry Brown and a bipartisan supermajority of state legislators secured a 10-year extension to the state's ambitious program for reducing carbon emissions. AB 398 extends California's cap-and-trade program to 2030, while a companion bill, AB 617, offers important tools for improving air quality in heavily burdened communities.
 - <u>Governor Brown</u> (<u>Mercury News</u>): "Tonight, California stood tall and, once again, boldly confronted the existential threat of our time."
- Ten years after the passage of the Global Warming Solutions Act (AB 32), California <u>extended and strengthened</u> California's greenhouse gas emissions reduction goal to 40 percent below 1990 levels by 2030. Governor Jerry Brown has pledged to aggressively continue work to address climate and <u>partner with other states and nations</u>.
- After the 2016 election, Gov. Jerry Brown mounted a vigorous defense of California's climate leadership and the role they will continue to play in setting the stage for ongoing progress and defending the important progress of the last eight years. "We've got the scientists, we've got the lawyers and we're ready to fight. We're ready to defend."

Colorado

- In July 2017, Gov. John Hickenlooper signed an <u>executive order</u> committing the state to <u>slash</u> greenhouse gas emissions 26 percent below 2005 levels by 2026, consistent with U.S. goals under the Paris Agreement. The order also sets a goal of reducing carbon pollution from the power sector in Colorado 25% by 2025 and 35% by 2030, without raising electricity prices for ratepayers.
- Colorado also joined the <u>U.S. Climate Alliance</u> a growing coalition of U.S. states committed to upholding the Paris Accords.
- <u>Governor Hickenlooper</u> (<u>statement</u>): "The vast majority of our residents, and indeed the country, expect us to help lead the way toward a clean and affordable energy future. In this process, we no doubt can address climate change while keeping a priority on household budgets."
- Governor Hickenlooper (press release): "Clean energy is a win for Colorado jobs, a win for Colorado consumers, and a win for cleaner air. We look forward to

- continuing our progress and working with this administration to create 21st century jobs for a 21st century workforce."
- In March 2017, the Colorado Public Utilities Commission <u>issued</u> a landmark order requiring utility Xcel Energy to consider a social cost of carbon in its integrated resource planning process.
- <u>Governor Hickenlooper (Colorado Independent)</u>: The governor remains committed to fulfilling the goals of the Clean Power Plan, no matter what happens to the rule.

Illinois

• On Dec. 7, 2016, Illinois enacted a <u>comprehensive new energy bill</u> that will in part double the state's energy efficiency portfolio and allow for 4,300 MW of new solar and wind power, while providing for continued operation of zero-emission nuclear facilities, which will reduce the state's carbon emissions 56% by 2030.

Maryland

• On Feb. 2, 2017, the Maryland legislature <u>voted to override</u> Gov. Larry Hogan's veto of a bill to increase the state's Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS). The bill increases the RPS to 25% by 2020, up from 20% by 2022.

Massachusetts

• Two carbon pricing bills in the Massachusetts statehouse have <u>picked up support</u> from 40 percent of the state's legislators. Carbon tax bills pending in Connecticut and Rhode Island are tied to successful passage in Massachusetts.

Michigan

- On Dec. 15, 2016, Michigan <u>lawmakers approved a new bill</u> to increase the state's renewable portfolio standard to 15% by 2021, up from 10%.
- Republican Gov. Rick Snyder (YouTube statement): "We've got a lot of aging coal plants that are beyond their useful life, and it's not worth investing in them anymore. ... We can transition to both natural gas and renewables and let the markets sort of define the balance between those two, so we're moving away from an old energy source [where] we had to import all of this coal."

Minnesota

• Frank Kohlasch, Air Assessments Section Manager at Minnesota's Pollution Control Agency (*ClimateWire*): Even if Minnesota stops official Clean Power Plan work, Kohlasch said his agency may keep using the same stakeholder group to look at ways to cut carbon. He acknowledged the rule's deadlines added some urgency to the talks and without it other states likely will not work as much on carbon reductions. But he said he believes trends toward natural gas, renewable power and energy savings will continue regardless.

Nevada

- Nevada State Assemblyman Chris Brooks (interview): "When you see zero leadership coming from D.C. on issues of such importance, states feel the urgency. I believe that is why states have ratcheted up these [clean energy] initiatives."
- Brooks <u>introduced</u> legislation on Feb. 13, 2017, that would increase the state's renewable portfolio standard to 50% by 2030 and 80% by 2040.

New York

- In January 2017, Gov. Andrew Cuomo <u>announced</u> a new commitment for New York to reduce greenhouse gas emissions 30 percent below 2020 levels by 2030. "With this proposal, New York will lower the emissions cap even further and set the precedent for recognizing and taking action against climate change to support the future of communities across the globe."
- In his 2017 State of the State address, Gov. Andrew Cuomo <u>asserted</u>, "We are not going to stop until we reach 100% renewable because that's what a sustainable New York is really all about."

North Carolina

- On March 9, 2017, North Carolina <u>withdrew</u> its legal challenge to the Clean Power Plan. North Carolina was one of 27 states suing the EPA over the CPP.
- Dept. of Environmental Quality secretary Michael Regan (<u>press release</u>): "We did not feel this case was a good use of our agency's or taxpayers' resources, and it did not align with our mission. This will enable us to devote more of our time and energy toward protection of air, water and natural resources."

Ohio

- Late in 2016, Gov. John Kasich <u>vetoed</u> a bill that would have effectively extended the state's freeze on renewable energy standards for two more years.
- From <u>Cleveland.com</u> (Dec. 27, 2016): "In vetoing Substitute House Bill 554, Kasich credited Ohio's 'wide range of energy generation options' with helping to grow jobs in the state over the past six years."

Oregon

- State lawmakers in Oregon <u>introduced</u> legislation in 2017 that would establish a statewide cap-and-trade program and reduce carbon emissions 75 percent below 1990 levels by 2050.
- Oregon regulators are evaluating options for a market-based mechanism that <u>could link</u> to the California-Quebec carbon market, releasing a <u>partial draft report</u> on Nov. 21, 2016.

Pennsylvania

- Governor Tom Wolf (press release): "I urge President Trump not to abdicate the United States' global leadership and seat at the table on climate change a pressing issue for Pennsylvania's economy, especially energy, agriculture and tourism, and our resident's health. Pennsylvania is an energy leader and addressing emissions presents opportunities for Pennsylvania's natural gas, renewable energy and energy efficiency industries to grow and create new jobs.
- <u>Dept. of Environmental Protection Spokesman Neil Shader (NPR StateImpact)</u>: "DEP will continue to seek ways to continue addressing climate change."

Virginia

Virginia regulators are <u>working to establish a "trading-ready" program</u> to slash
power plant carbon emissions in response to an executive order Governor Terry
McAuliffe <u>signed</u> in May 2017. "Today, I am proud to take executive action to cut
greenhouse gases and make Virginia a leader in the global clean energy
economy," Governor McAuliffe said when the order was signed.

Washington

• In December 2016, Washington Governor Jay Inslee <u>proposed</u> the state adopt a first-of-its-kind carbon tax of \$25 per metric ton of carbon pollution. The proposal supplements the state's innovative <u>Clean Air Rule</u>, adopted in September, which caps carbon emissions from individual polluters. Governor Inslee has <u>also proposed</u> that Washington reduce greenhouse gas emissions 80 percent by 2050 from 1990 levels.

Multi-state: Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI)

• Nine states comprising the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) in August <u>announced a proposal</u> to cut carbon pollution from the power sector an additional 30 percent between 2020 and 2030 — a 65 percent reduction below the original 2009 pollution cap. The proposal demonstrates bipartisan commitment to combat climate change, with five Republican and four Democratic governors helming the RGGI states (Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, New York, Rhode Island, and Vermont). Meanwhile, both New Jersey gubernatorial frontrunners from have pledged to rejoin RGGI after the 2017 election.

* * *

Key State Planning and Progress towards CPP Compliance

Across the country, many states continue to remain on track to meet or exceed goals for reducing carbon emissions from the power sector laid out in the Clean Power Plan.

Arizona

- Arizona is "well positioned" to comply and already on track to meet interim goals
 under business as usual, according to analysis by <u>Pace Global</u>; modeling from
 <u>Arizona State University</u> similarly found that compliance was eminently feasible.
- From <u>ClimateWire</u> (June 3, 2016): "Arizona may be able to meet U.S. EPA's Clean Power Plan standards solely with existing plans to retire coal plants and shift to cleaner sources of energy, according to two models reviewed by state officials in recent meetings." The article quoted Advanced Energy Economy's Amanda Ormond: "there's a really big difference between the rhetoric of how difficult the Clean Power Plan's going to be to meet versus the technical discussions."
- From <u>ClimateWire</u> (June 3, 2016): "Timothy Franquist, who recently became DEQ's air quality division director after Eric Massey stepped down for a job at the Arizona Public Service Co., said, "We don't want to fall so far behind that we have to play a lot of catch-up should the stay be lifted."
- From <u>ClimateWire</u> (May 31, 2016): "In Arizona, the Department of Environmental Quality...has...held private meetings with a <u>technical work</u> group of utilities and a few clean energy groups and consumer and environmental advocates...Arizona <u>continues to make progress</u> deploying emission reduction strategies.

Arkansas

• The state of Arkansas – which is litigating against the Clean Power Plan – <u>already reached</u> its 2030 CPP compliance target last year, thanks to declining coal use in favor of more renewables and natural gas. An in-depth <u>Arkansas Democrat-Gazette</u> article found that "low natural-gas prices" was the most common reason cited by utility leaders for the decline in coal use.

California

California released a <u>draft</u> of its Clean Power Plan compliance plan in early
August, the first state to do so. <u>Stanley Young</u>, spokesman for the California Air
Resources Board said it's "a proof of concept for other states, to demonstrate that
this is a program that can be adapted to each state and that can be set up in a way
that we can form a regional association."

Colorado

- Governor Hickenlooper (Denver Post): "We think we can go beyond what that Clean Power Plan said. We think we can be more ambitious.'...Hickenlooper is drafting an executive order to cut state power sector emissions by at least 35 percent by 2030."
- Xcel Energy continues to make progress on the decarbonization of their Colorado system, working to gain approval from the Colorado PUC for a proposal to integrate an additional 600 MWs of wind energy on their system. Xcel

- <u>announced</u> it reached a settlement with 11 other stakeholders in the PUC proceeding to support the Rush Creek wind farm.
- Colorado electric cooperative Tri-state Generation will shut down two coal plants with 527 megawatts of generating capacity by 2022 and 2025, respectively, and install pollution controls on two others in order to meet their existing regional haze obligations under the Clean Air Act. "Those reductions are needed to achieve compliance with state and federal clean air plans and to improve air quality in once pristine parts of the state now suffering big reductions in visibility."

Georgia

• Sheree Kernizan, Electric Unit Director for the Georgia PSC (E&E News) (April 26, 2016): "We were already on track under the proposed rules to kind of meet the [Clean Power Plan] goals anyway -- without doing anything -- and this was prior to the 2016 [integrated resource plan] that was filed this year."

Illinois

- <u>Illinois Attorney General</u> Lisa Madigan (<u>statement</u>) (March 29, 2016): "I look forward to continuing to work with other states to advance the Clean Power Plan, as well as to advocate for a comprehensive portfolio of renewable energy sources and enhancements to energy efficiency programs."
- <u>Ann McCabe, Illinois Commerce Commission (E&E News</u>): The Clean Power Plan listening sessions remain "in the works." (February 12, 2016).

<u>Iowa</u>

• Iowa's utility regulator <u>recently approved</u> a massive \$3.6 billion, 2000 megawatt wind project proposed by power company MidAmerican energy.

From a MidAmerican <u>press release</u>: "Our customers want more renewable energy, and we couldn't agree more."

Louisiana

• <u>Chuck Carr Brown, Secretary of the Dept. of Environmental Quality</u> (<u>E&E News</u>): "Some of the coal states are saying, 'Put your pencils down'... I took this as an opportunity to sharpen the pencil -- to create something that is going to work for the state of Louisiana."

Massachusetts

• Gov. Charlie Baker recently signed an <u>executive order</u> to ensure the state follows through on its ambitious climate change commitments. The Order establishes an "integrated climate change strategy" to help Massachusetts meet its goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions 25% by 2020, and 80% by 2050 over 1990 levels. (*UtilityDive*)

Michigan

- Even in 2015, the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality stated that the state can comply with the federal Clean Power Plan to reduce carbon emissions without changing anything until at least 2025.
- The state "would be largely in compliance" with the rule under expected "business as usual" conditions, according to a recent <u>report</u> by the Electric Power Research Institute.

In September 2016, Michigan energy officials <u>released</u> two reports (<u>here</u> and <u>here</u>) concluding that several low-cost compliance pathways are available to the state. "Putting these two modeling efforts together provide Michigan useful information regarding the choices we will have to make over the next two decades whether or not the federal carbon rule for clean air is put into place," Michigan Public Service Commission Chairman Sally Talberg, a Snyder appointee, said in a statement.

Minnesota

- Minnesota is continuing to develop its CPP implementation plan, even though
 the rule has been stayed. A <u>letter to the Minnesota state legislature</u> from the
 agency responsible for implementing the CPP in Minnesota explains, "Regardless
 of the court ruling, one thing is certain: the movement toward lower carbon
 emissions in Minnesota's energy sector will continue."
- Minnesota Releases Policy Blueprint: Minnesota's Environmental Quality Board (EQB) also released the Climate Solutions and Economic Opportunities (CSEO) report to serve as a foundation for state climate action planning to achieve the state's greenhouse gas emission reduction goals.

Nevada

- <u>Governor Sandoval</u> (<u>statement</u>): "The Governor is focused on finding a uniquely Nevada policy solution for clean and renewable energy...centered around the tenets laid out in the bipartisan Clean Energy Accord that he signed with 16 other governors."
- Clean energy investments continue to move forward in Nevada. The Interior Department formally <u>approved</u> a utility-scale solar project in southern Nevada. The 100 MW Aiya Solar Project...has the capacity to produce enough electricity to power 25,000 homes.

Pennsylvania

• <u>Dept. of Environmental Protection Spokesman Neil Shader (NPR StateImpact)</u>: "Regardless of the ultimate outcome, Pennsylvania's carbon footprint has been shrinking rapidly due to market based decisions being made in the state's electric generating sector, particularly rapid switching toward natural gas...DEP will continue to seek ways to continue addressing climate change."

- <u>Dept. of Environmental Protection head John Quigley (NPR StateImpact</u>): "It just makes good business sense to continue to plan for what we know is going to happen. This is inevitable."
- Gladys Brown, chairwoman of the Public Utility Commission (EnergyWire): "I know things appear to have slowed down because of the court challenge, but that's just appearances." The PUC has dedicated four staff members to work with the DEP towards a compliance plan.
- <u>Analysis</u> by Georgia Institute of Technology shows that Pennsylvania households will *save* money on electricity bills---by 6.7%---under the least-cost CPP compliance pathway.
- From <u>Law360</u>: PJM, which operates the grid for Pennsylvania and 12 other states, found "The CO2 emissions reduction goals of the Clean Power Plan can be achieved within the PJM footprint under each of the seven compliance pathways studied...Regardless of the compliance pathway, resource adequacy is maintained in the PJM footprint."

South Carolina

- From a February 11 <u>news article</u>: "But some states, more aggressive in their carbon reduction work, say they will continue with their efforts regardless of the case's outcome. South Carolina has indicated it expects to continue work to decarbonize the state's power industry, an effort which began two years ago."
- From *The New York Times*, July 19, 2016: "South Carolina regulators are moving forward with meetings on a new state energy plan...which...will probably include discussion of how to reduce emissions from electric power plants. It will just not be called the Clean Power Plan."
 - <u>Dukes Scott, top regulator for Gov. Nikki R. Haley:</u> "We're still working on clean air, just not pursuant to the Clean Power Plan." "He added that if the Clean Power Plan was upheld by the courts, South Carolina's work on an energy plan that includes lower emissions from power plants could be repurposed in its work to comply with the climate plan."

Washington

- Washington has <u>continued to move ahead</u> with its multi-sector carbon reduction strategy, releasing a new Clean Air Rule that sets individual caps for the state's largest sources of carbon emissions. Over time, the rule will expand to cover a greater number of sources and require deeper emission reductions.
- The <u>Clean Air Rule</u> moves Washington closer to achieving its state greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets, and aims to help the state achieve greater reductions than the Clean Power Plan would require.

Wyoming:

- From a February 13, 2016 <u>news article</u>: "[Governor] Mead, in an interview Friday, said Wyoming would continue to oppose the rules in court...The Cowboy State nevertheless will continue compliance planning, albeit at a slower pace, he said.
- State Sen. Michael Von Flatern, Chair of the Senate Minerals, Business and Economic Development Committee (Casper Star Tribune): "Whatever the court decides and our neighboring states and our receiving states choose, Wyoming should be prepared."
- The New York Times (July 19, 2016) reported that Wyoming is moving forward with efforts to comply with the Clean Power Plan. The Times quoted Governor Mead: "Obviously we're suing and going to fight, but from my court experience, I know you have to prepare not to win."

Multi-state: Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative

• The nine Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) states (Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, New York, Rhode Island, and Vermont) are already on track to hit CPP compliance goals <u>a decade early</u> if 2020 RGGI targets simply flat line through 2030.

The states are <u>considering</u> going far beyond CPP requirements by implementing more stringent targets. Regulators are weighing proposals to lower targets an additional 2.5% or 5% per year from 2020 through 2030.

* * *

States Respond to Clean Power Plan Supreme Court Stay

In response to the U.S. Supreme Court's stay of the Clean Power Plan in February 2016, many state officials committed to continue working towards compliance and meeting the carbon reduction targets laid out in the CPP.

Arizona

• <u>Eric Massey of Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (AZ Central)</u>: "The state will continue gathering information while the court considers the Clean Power Plan."

California

- Governor Brown (statement): "As the world gets hotter and closer to irreversible climate change, these justices appear tone-deaf as they fiddle with procedural niceties. This arbitrary roadblock does incalculable damage and undermines America's climate leadership. But make no mistake, this won't stop California from continuing to do its part under the Clean Power Plan."
- Attorney General Kamala Harris (<u>statement</u>): "I am extremely disappointed by the Supreme Court's decision today to block President Obama's Clean Power

Plan. The Court's decision, and the special interests working to undermine this plan, threatens our environment, public health and economy."

Colorado

- Governor Hickenlooper (<u>Colorado Statesman</u>) (April 7, 2016): "Our full intention is to get to, and in many cases exceed, what the goals are in the Clean Power Plan... The focus of...this state is to get to cleaner air in real time."
- Governor Hickenlooper (<u>statement</u>) (February 10, 2016): "While we're still reviewing the implications of the Supreme Court's decision, we remain committed to having the cleanest air in the nation. We'll continue to build upon the great strides we've made as a state with the Clean Air Clean Jobs Act and our Renewable Energy Standard to protect our public health and environment."
- CO Department of Public Health & Environment (statement) (February 11, 2016): "It is prudent for Colorado to move forward during the litigation to ensure that the state is not left at a disadvantage if the courts uphold all or part of the Clean Power Plan."

Connecticut

- Governor Dannel Malloy (<u>statement</u>) (February 10, 2016): "The Supreme Court's ruling to pause implementation of the Clean Power Plan is disappointing and shortsighted. However, it is not a final decision on the legal merits of the Clean Power Plan, so it is important that we continue with preparations for compliance with the plan while these issues are being worked out in the courts."

 "Connecticut is already a national leader on global warming and that will not change. We have an obligation to combat greenhouse gases, and Connecticut is going to continue to do just that."
- <u>Jack Betkoski, Connecticut Public Utilities Regulatory Authority</u> (<u>E&E News</u>): The ruling "changes but does not end the need for conversation [among states]."

Delaware

• Governor Jack Markell (via Facebook) (February 11, 2016): "I am disappointed in yesterday's Supreme Court action on the EPA Clean Power Plan, but optimistic that it will be upheld when the courts review the merits of the case. We remain determined to move forward in responding to the issue of climate change."

<u>Idaho</u>

<u>Idaho Department of Environmental Quality</u> (<u>SNL</u>): "The <u>Idaho DEQ</u> will continue to work with the Office of Energy Resources and the Idaho Public Utilities Commission to determine the best options for the state if the rule is reinstated. Meanwhile, technical analysis of the rule and its impacts will continue."

Iowa

• <u>Iowa Department of Natural Resources (statement)</u>: "Given the judicial uncertainty of the rule, hearing from stakeholders on the way forward is very important."

The Iowa DNR <u>plans</u> to move forward with a previously scheduled Clean Power Plan stakeholder meeting on February 22.

Maine

Attorney General Janet Mills (statement) (March 29, 2016): "Global climate change demands immediate action and I am committed to using the authority of my office to address the problem in a meaningful way by defending important EPA regulations against attacks led by the coal industry and exploring litigation options that will hold the worst polluters accountable for their actions."

Massachusetts

- Attorney General Maura Healey (<u>statement</u>) (February 10, 2016): "Although we are disappointed with the Supreme Court's decision to delay implementation of the EPA's Clean Power Plan, we believe the courts will uphold this program after full consideration of the merits of the case...As this case proceeds we will work with our coalition of states and local governments to continue to defend the Clean Power Plan's reasonable, flexible and cost effective approach to lowering the greenhouse gas emissions of our country's power plants."
- <u>Peter Lorenz, Energy and Environmental Affairs spokesman</u> (<u>E&E News</u>): "Based on our review, the Commonwealth, as part of the nine-state Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI), is well positioned to meet the goals of the federal Clean Power Plan."

Minnesota

- Governor Mark Dayton (statement) (February 10, 2016): "While the Court's temporary stay is disappointing, it does nothing to diminish our resolve in Minnesota to keep moving forward on clean energy initiatives, including the development of our state's Clean Power Plan."
- <u>Minnesota Pollution Control Agency</u> (<u>via Twitter</u>) February 10, 2016):
 "CleanPowerPlanMN is moving forward attend our listening session in Bemidji next week."
- David Thornton, Assistant Commissioner of the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency (E&E News): "We will go full speed ahead."

Nevada:

• Governor Brian Sandoval (<u>statement</u>) (February 23, 2016): "Nevada was already well on the road to compliance with proposed federal regulations concerning carbon emission rate reductions. The Task Force will be making

- recommendations for the state to consider with regard to future EPA compliance issues, but more importantly to do the right thing for the people of Nevada."
- Governor Sandoval (<u>statement</u>) (February 25, 2016): "The Governor did not request the filing of an amicus brief in the Clean Power Plan case. The Governor is focused on finding a uniquely Nevada policy solution for clean and renewable energy through the work of the recently reconvened New Energy Industry Task Force."

New Hampshire

• Governor Maggie Hassan (statement) (February 10, 2016): "New Hampshire has long led efforts to cut carbon emissions and combat climate change so that we can have the cleaner and safer environment that our people need to live healthy, productive lives – and it's crucial that other states follow our lead and take responsibility for the pollution that they cause...That's why I have been a strong supporter of the Clean Power Plan, and the Supreme Court's decision to delay this important step forward is very disappointing."

New Mexico

• NM Environment Secretary Ryan Flynn (<u>statement</u>) "Despite capricious political winds, the New Mexico Environment Department remains committed to taking meaningful action to reduce greenhouse gases by a projected 5.7 million tons by the end of 2017."

New York

- AG Eric Schneiderman + Joint Statement of States and Counties* (February 10, 2016): "We are confident that once the courts have fully reviewed the merits of the Clean Power Plan, it will be upheld as lawful under the Clean Air Act. Our coalition of states and local governments will continue to vigorously defend the Clean Power Plan —which is critical to ensuring that necessary progress is made in confronting climate change."
 - *Additional states and cities: California, Connecticut, Hawaii, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, New Mexico, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, the District of Columbia, the cities of New York, Boulder, Chicago, Philadelphia, South Miami and Broward County, Florida.
- <u>Governor Andrew Cuomo</u> (<u>The Guardian</u>) (February 10, 2016): "New York State remains committed to moving forward with our own actions to protect the environment and the public health. But this issue requires a global response and the Clean Power Plan is crucial to ensuring a cleaner, greener, and safer future for all."

Oregon

• Governor Kate Brown (via Facebook, February 10, 2016): "Even though the Clean Power Plan is going through a battle in the courts, Oregon has been and

continues to be committed to national efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from the power sector. Oregon is well-positioned to comply with the EPA targets because there have already been early actions in Oregon through investments in energy efficiency, renewable energy development, and moving away from coal."

Pennsylvania

- DEP Secretary John Quigley (<u>Pittsburgh Post Gazette</u>) (February 11, 2016): "The rule's in effect, the rule hasn't gone away. We, at least currently, see a path to submitting [a state plan] on Sept. 6... It's clear that renewables are the future. What the Clean Power Plan is calling for is really good business."
- <u>Jeff Sheridan, Governor Wolf's Spokesman (NPR StateImpact)</u> (February 10, 2016): "Pennsylvania will continue planning and engagement with stakeholders on the Clean Power Plan, pending final decision of this issue by the Supreme Court."

Vermont

• Governor Peter Shumlin (statement) (February 10, 2016): "This is incredibly disappointing news. It is no surprise that the suit over the Clean Power Plan was brought by proponents of the coal industry. That industry, and those who support it, will do everything they can to boost their profits, even if it means imperiling our planet's future. This is just one more example why Vermont should not be in the business of supporting the coal industry and should divest from coal stocks."

Virginia

• Governor McAuliffe (<u>statement</u>) (February 10, 2016): "Over the last several months my administration has been working with a diverse group of Virginia stakeholders that includes members of the environmental, business, and energy communities to develop a strong, viable path forward to comply with the Clean Power Plan. As this court case moves forward, we will stay on course and continue to develop the elements for a Virginia plan to reduce carbon emissions and stimulate our clean energy economy."

Washington

• Governor Inslee (<u>statement</u>) (February 10, 2016): "Yesterday's Supreme Court ruling on the Clean Power Plan is very troubling, surprising, and disappointing. We cannot afford to wait any longer for federal action to address carbon pollution and transition to clean energy. Here in Washington State we are unfortunately already seeing the harmful impacts of climate change, and we will continue to take steps that reduce carbon and to lead the nation in clean energy. The EPA's Clean Power Plan remains a crucial tool to ensure that every state must do its part, and to empower them to do so."