

The undersigned Intervenor-Respondent States and Municipalities (State Intervenor) oppose petitioner North Dakota's untimely motion to sever and consolidate filed on April 11, 2017, ECF No. 1670187. The Court's February 24, 2017 Order in *North Dakota v EPA*, No. 17-1014, set March 31, 2017 as the procedural motion deadline. Contrary to North Dakota's contention, N.D. Mot. 8, n.4, its motion to consolidate is a procedural motion subject to such deadline. *See* D.C. Cir. Handbook of Practice and Internal Procedure 28 (Jan. 26, 2017 rev.) ("Procedural motions are those that may affect the progress of the case through the Court, *e.g.*, . . . motions to consolidate, . . ."). Thus, the Court should reject North Dakota's motion as untimely, as well as prejudicial in light of the Court's determination to expedite *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363.

If entertained, the Court should deny North Dakota's motion and resolve the *North Dakota* reconsideration proceedings in the regular course for the reasons stated by State Intervenor in their oppositions (ECF Nos. 1665788 & 1670114) to nearly identical motions to sever and consolidate previously filed by a subset of petitioners in these cases. North Dakota's attempt to delay resolution of this case so that it may file supplemental briefing on issues that have either been fully briefed and argued in *West Virginia* or that can be fully considered and resolved by a three-judge panel in *North Dakota*, would be inefficient and inconsistent with

this Court's practice in similar cases, and would result in unnecessary and prejudicial delay in resolving the *West Virginia* case.

On the other hand, North Dakota and the other petitioners seeking consolidation cannot demonstrate any prejudice from denial of consolidation. The possibility that this Court's resolution of *West Virginia* could result in the stay of the Rule being lifted while the petitions in *North Dakota* are still pending is entirely speculative. In any event, the stay would only be lifted if the Rule were upheld by this Court and/or the Supreme Court. At that time, petitioners in *North Dakota* could seek a new stay of the Rule based on the arguments presented in that case that were not resolved in *West Virginia*. Petitioners would of course need to establish the prerequisites for such a stay, including a likelihood of success on the merits of those claims and irreparable harm.

CONCLUSION

This Court should deny the motion.

Dated: April 17, 2017

Respectfully Submitted,

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Morgan A. Costello¹

Barbara D. Underwood

Solicitor General

Steven C. Wu

Deputy Solicitor General

Michael J. Myers

Morgan A. Costello

Brian Lusignan

Assistant Attorneys General

Environmental Protection Bureau

The Capitol

Albany, NY 12224

(518) 776-2400

¹ Counsel for the State of New York represents that the other parties listed in the signature blocks below consent to the filing of this motion.

FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

XAVIER BECERRA

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Robert W. Byrne

Sally Magnani

Senior Assistant Attorneys General

Gavin G. McCabe

David A. Zonana

Supervising Deputy Attorneys General

Jonathan Wiener

M. Elaine Meckenstock

Deputy Attorneys General

1515 Clay Street

Oakland, CA 94612

(510) 879-1300

Attorneys for the State of California,
by and through Governor Edmund G.
Brown, Jr., the California Air
Resources Board, and Attorney
General Xavier Becerra

FOR THE STATE OF DELAWARE

MATTHEW P. DENN

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Valerie S. Edge

Deputy Attorney General

Delaware Department of Justice

102 West Water Street, 3d Floor

Dover, DE 19904

(302) 739-4636

FOR THE STATE OF
CONNECTICUT

GEORGE JEPSEN

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Matthew I. Levine

Scott N. Koschwitz

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 120, 55 Elm Street

Hartford, CT 06141-0120

(860) 808-5250

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAII

DOUGLAS S. CHIN

ATTORNEY GENERAL

William F. Cooper

Deputy Attorney General

465 S. King Street, Room 200

Honolulu, HI 96813

(808) 586-4070

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

LISA MADIGAN
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Matthew J. Dunn
Gerald T. Karr
James P. Gignac
Assistant Attorneys General
69 W. Washington St., 18th Floor
Chicago, IL 60602
(312) 814-0660

FOR THE STATE OF MAINE

JANET T. MILLS
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Gerald D. Reid
Natural Resources Division Chief
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333
(207) 626-8800

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Melissa A. Hoffer
Christophe Courchesne
Assistant Attorneys General
Environmental Protection Division
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
(617) 963-2423

FOR THE STATE OF IOWA

THOMAS J. MILLER
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Jacob Larson
Assistant Attorney General
Office of Iowa Attorney General
Hoover State Office Building
1305 E. Walnut Street, 2nd Floor
Des Moines, Iowa 50319
(515) 281-5341

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Steven M. Sullivan
Solicitor General
200 St. Paul Place, 20th Floor
Baltimore, MD 21202
(410) 576-6427

FOR THE STATE OF MINNESOTA

LORI SWANSON
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Karen D. Olson
Deputy Attorney General
Max Kieley
Assistant Attorney General
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 900
St. Paul, MN 55101-2127
(651) 757-1244

Attorneys for State of Minnesota, by
and through the Minnesota Pollution
Control Agency

FOR THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO

HECTOR BALDERAS
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Joseph Yar
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
408 Galisteo Street
Villagra Building
Santa Fe, NM 87501
(505) 490-4060

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE
ISLAND

PETER F. KILMARTIN
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Gregory S. Schultz
Special Assistant Attorney General
Rhode Island Department of Attorney
General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
(401) 274-4400

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
VIRGINIA

MARK HERRING
ATTORNEY GENERAL
John W. Daniel, II
Deputy Attorney General
Donald D. Anderson
Sr. Asst. Attorney General and Chief
Matthew L. Gooch
Assistant Attorney General
Environmental Section
Office of the Attorney General
900 East Main Street
Richmond, VA 23219

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Paul Garrahan
Attorney-in-Charge
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301-4096
(503) 947-4593

FOR THE STATE OF VERMONT

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Nicholas F. Persampieri
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609-1001
(802) 828-6902

FOR THE STATE OF
WASHINGTON

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Katharine G. Shirey
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
P.O. Box 40117
Olympia, WA 98504-0117
(360) 586-6769

(804) 225-3193

FOR THE DISTRICT OF
COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE
ATTORNEY GENERAL
James C. McKay, Jr.
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
441 Fourth Street, NW
Suite 630 South
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 724-5690

FOR THE CITY OF BOULDER

TOM CARR
CITY ATTORNEY
Debra S. Kalish
City Attorney's Office
1777 Broadway, Second Floor
Boulder, CO 80302
(303) 441-3020

FOR BROWARD COUNTY,
FLORIDA

JONI ARMSTRONG COFFEY
COUNTY ATTORNEY
Mark A. Journey
Assistant County Attorney
Broward County Attorney's Office
155 S. Andrews Avenue, Room 423
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301
(954) 357-7600

FOR THE CITY OF NEW YORK

ZACHARY W. CARTER
CORPORATION COUNSEL
Carrie Noteboom
Senior Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-2319

FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO

EDWARD N. SISKEL
Corporation Counsel
BENNA RUTH SOLOMON
Deputy Corporation Counsel
30 N. LaSalle Street, Suite 800
Chicago, IL 60602
(312) 744-7764

FOR THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

FOR THE CITY OF SOUTH MIAMI

SOZI PEDRO TULANTE

CITY SOLICITOR

Scott J. Schwarz

Patrick K. O'Neill

Divisional Deputy City Solicitors

The City of Philadelphia

Law Department

One Parkway Building

1515 Arch Street, 16th Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102-1595

(215) 685-6135

THOMAS F. PEPE

CITY ATTORNEY

City of South Miami

1450 Madruga Avenue, Ste 202

Coral Gables, Florida 33146

(305) 667-2564

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE WITH TYPE-VOLUME LIMIT

The undersigned attorney, Morgan A. Costello, hereby certifies:

1. This document complies with the type-volume limitations of Fed. R. App. P. 27(d)(2). According to the word processing system used in this office, this document, exclusive the caption, signature block, and any certificates of counsel, contains 394 words.

2. This document complies with the typeface requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(5) and the type-style requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(6) because this document has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface in 14-point Times New Roman.

/s/ Morgan A. Costello

MORGAN A. COSTELLO

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Opposition to North Dakota's Motion to Sever and Consolidate was filed on April 17, 2017 using the Court's CM/ECF system, and that, therefore, service was accomplished upon counsel of record by the Court's system.

/s/ Morgan A. Costello
MORGAN A. COSTELLO