

ORAL ARGUMENT NOT YET SCHEDULED

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

<p>STATE OF CALIFORNIA, <i>et al.</i>,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Petitioners,</p> <p style="text-align: center;">v.</p> <p>ANDREW R. WHEELER, <i>et al.</i>,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Respondents.</p>	<p>No. 19-1239 (consolidated with No. 19-1230)</p>
<p>CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Petitioners,</p> <p style="text-align: center;">v.</p> <p>ANDREW R. WHEELER, <i>et al.</i>,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Respondents.</p>	<p>No. 19-1246 (consolidated with No. 19-1230)</p>

**STATE AND MUNICIPAL PETITIONERS’
NON-BINDING STATEMENT OF ISSUES TO BE RAISED**

Pursuant to the Court’s Orders of November 20, 2019, and December 2, 2019,
the undersigned petitioners in *State of California, et al. v. Andrew Wheeler, et al.*
(Case No. 19-1239) and in *City and County of San Francisco v. Andrew Wheeler,*

et al. (Case No. 19-1246) (collectively, “State and Municipal Petitioners”), submit the following non-binding, preliminary statement of issues to be raised in these cases regarding the final action of Respondents United States Environmental Protection Agency and Administrator Andrew R. Wheeler (collectively, “EPA”) titled “The Safer Affordable Fuel-Efficient (SAFE) Vehicles Rule Part One: One National Program,” 84 Fed. Reg. 51,310 (Sept. 27, 2019) (the “Action”).

1. Whether the Action is *ultra vires*, arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Clean Air Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law because, *inter alia*, EPA lacks authority to revoke a waiver of preemption granted under Section 209(b) of the Clean Air Act, as it did here, and because EPA had no legitimate reason to take the Action.

2. Whether EPA’s revocation of parts of California’s waiver on the ground that the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration has issued a regulation purporting to declare state greenhouse gas emission and zero-emission vehicle standards for light-duty vehicles preempted by the Energy Policy and Conservation Act is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Clean Air Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law.

3. Whether EPA’s revocation of parts of California’s waiver on the ground that California does not need its greenhouse gas emission and zero-emission vehicle standards for model years 2021-2025 to meet extraordinary and compelling

conditions under Section 209(b)(1)(B) of the Clean Air Act is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Clean Air Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law.

4. Whether EPA's determination that Section 177 of the Clean Air Act excludes greenhouse gas emission standards is *ultra vires*, arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Clean Air Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law.

5. Whether the Action is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Clean Air Act and the Administrative Procedure Act because EPA failed to comply with required procedures, including considering the full record before the agency and considering and responding to comments.

NHTSA's Action:

In addition, while State and Municipal Petitioners believe the district court has original jurisdiction over the action of Respondents United States Department of Transportation, Secretary Elaine L. Chao, National Highway Traffic Safety Administration, and Acting Administrator James C. Owens (collectively, "NHTSA") set forth in the same Federal Register notice, their petitions for review protectively challenge that action. Therefore, State and Municipal Petitioners submit the following non-binding, preliminary statement of issues with respect to that action:

6. Whether the action is *ultra vires*, arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Energy Policy and Conservation Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law because NHTSA lacks authority to issue a regulation declaring state laws preempted by the Energy Policy and Conservation Act.

7. Whether NHTSA's declaration that state greenhouse gas emission and zero-emission vehicle standards are expressly preempted by the Energy Policy and Conservation Act is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Energy Policy and Conservation Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law.

8. Whether NHTSA's declaration that state greenhouse gas emission and zero-emission vehicle standards are conflict-preempted by the Energy Policy and Conservation Act is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Energy Policy and Conservation Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or other law.

9. Whether the action is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with law because NHTSA failed to perform the requisite analysis under the National Environmental Policy Act.

10. Whether the action is arbitrary and capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accord with the Energy Policy and Conservation Act and the

Administrative Procedure Act because NHTSA failed to comply with required procedures, including required consultations and the requirement to consider and respond to comments.

Dated: December 26, 2019

Respectfully Submitted,

FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

XAVIER BECERRA

Attorney General of California

ROBERT BYRNE

SALLY MAGNANI

Senior Assistant Attorneys General

GARY E. TAVETIAN

DAVID A. ZONANA

Supervising Deputy Attorneys General

JESSICA BARCLAY-STROBEL

MEREDITH HANKINS

JENNIFER KALNINS TEMPLE

M. ELAINE MECKENSTOCK

JONATHAN A. WIENER

Deputy Attorneys General

/s/ Julia K. Forgie

JULIA K. FORGIE

Deputy Attorney General

300 S. Spring St., Suite 1702

Los Angeles, CA 90013

Telephone: (213) 269-6623

Julia.Forgie@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
California, by and through its
Governor Gavin Newsom, Attorney
General Xavier Becerra, and
California Air Resources Board*

FOR THE STATE OF COLORADO

PHIL WEISER
Colorado Attorney General

/s/ Eric R. Olson

ERIC R. OLSON
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
Telephone: (720) 508-6562
eric.olson@coag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Colorado*

FOR THE STATE OF CONNECTICUT

WILLIAM TONG
Attorney General of Connecticut
MATTHEW I. LEVINE
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Scott N. Koschwitz

SCOTT N. KOSCHWITZ
Assistant Attorney General
165 Capitol Avenue
Hartford, CT 06106
Telephone: (860) 808-5250
Fax: (860) 808-5386
Scott.Koschwitz@ct.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Connecticut*

FOR THE STATE OF DELAWARE

KATHLEEN JENNINGS
Attorney General of the State of
Delaware

/s/ Kayli H. Spialter

KAYLI H. SPIALTER
CHRISTIAN WRIGHT
Deputy Attorneys General
Delaware Department of Justice
820 N. French Street, 6th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801
Telephone: (302) 395-2604
Kayli.spialter@delaware.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Delaware*

FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE
Attorney General for the District of
Columbia

/s/ Loren L. AliKhan

LOREN L. ALIKHAN
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General for the
District of Columbia
One Judiciary Square
441 4th Street, NW, Suite 630 South
Washington, D.C. 20001
Telephone: (202) 727-6287
Fax: (202) 730-1864
Loren.AliKhan@dc.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner District of
Columbia*

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAII

CLARE E. CONNORS
Attorney General

/s/ William F. Cooper

WILLIAM F. COOPER
Deputy Attorney General
State of Hawaii Office of the Attorney
General

425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813
Telephone: (808) 586-4070
Bill.F.Cooper@Hawaii.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Hawaii*

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

KWAME RAOUL
Attorney General of Illinois
MATTHEW J. DUNN
Chief, Environmental Enforcement/
Asbestos Litigation Division
JASON E. JAMES
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Daniel I. Rottenberg

DANIEL I. ROTTENBERG
Assistant Attorney General
69 W. Washington St., 18th Floor
Chicago, IL 60602
Telephone: (312) 814-3816
DRottenberg@atg.state.il.us

Attorneys for Petitioner State of Illinois

FOR THE STATE OF MAINE

AARON M. FREY
Attorney General of Maine

/s/ Laura E. Jensen

LAURA E. JENSEN
Assistant Attorney General
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333
Telephone: (207) 626-8868
Fax: (207) 626-8812
Laura.Jensen@maine.gov

Attorneys for Petitioner State of Maine

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH
Attorney General of Maryland

/s/ Roberta R. James

ROBERTA R. JAMES
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Maryland Department of the
Environment
1800 Washington Blvd.
Baltimore, MD 21230
Telephone: (410) 537-3748

JOHN B. HOWARD, JR.
JOSHUA M. SEGAL
STEVEN J. GOLDSTEIN
Special Assistant Attorneys General
Office of the Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place
Baltimore, MD 21202
Telephone: (410) 576-6300

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Maryland*

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY
Attorney General
CHRISTOPHE COURCHESNE
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Environmental Protection
Division
CAROL IANCU
Assistant Attorney General
MEGAN M. HERZOG
Special Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Matthew Ireland

MATTHEW IRELAND
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Protection Division
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
Telephone: (617) 727-2200
matthew.ireland@mass.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner
Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF
MICHIGAN

DANA NESSEL
Attorney General of Michigan

/s/ Neil D. Gordon

NEIL D. GORDON
GILLIAN E. WENER
Assistant Attorneys General
Michigan Department of Attorney
General
Environment, Natural Resources
and Agriculture Division
P.O. Box 30755
Lansing, MI 48909
Telephone: (517) 335-7664
gordonn1@michigan.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner People of the
State of Michigan*

FOR THE STATE OF MINNESOTA

KEITH ELLISON
Attorney General of Minnesota

/s/ Peter N. Surdo

PETER N. SURDO
Special Assistant Attorney General
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 900
St. Paul, MN, 55101
Telephone: (651) 757-1061
Peter.Surdo@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Minnesota*

FOR THE STATE OF NEVADA

AARON D. FORD
Attorney General of Nevada

/s/ Heidi Parry Stern

HEIDI PARRY STERN
Solicitor General
DANIEL P. NUBEL
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Nevada Attorney General
100 N. Carson Street
Carson City, NV 89701
HStern@ag.nv.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Nevada*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY

GURBIR S. GREWAL
Attorney General of New Jersey

/s/ Aaron A. Love

AARON A. LOVE
Deputy Attorney General
25 Market St., PO Box 093
Trenton, NJ 08625-0093
Telephone: (609) 376-2762
Fax: (609) 341-5031
aaron.love@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New
Jersey*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO

HECTOR BALDERAS
Attorney General of New Mexico

/s/ Anne E. Minard

ANNE E. MINARD
Special Assistant Attorney General
State of New Mexico Office of the
Attorney General
Consumer & Environmental Protection
Division
408 Galisteo Street
Santa Fe, NM 87501
Telephone: (505) 490-4045
aminard@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New
Mexico*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of New York
YUEH-RU CHU
Chief, Affirmative Litigation Section
Environmental Protection Bureau
AUSTIN THOMPSON
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Gavin G. McCabe

GAVIN G. MCCABE
Assistant Attorney General
28 Liberty Street, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10005
Telephone: (212) 416-8469
gavin.mccabe@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New
York*

FOR THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA

JOSHUA H. STEIN
Attorney General
DANIEL S. HIRSCHMAN
Senior Deputy Attorney General
FRANCISCO BENZONI
Special Deputy Attorney General

/s/ Asher P. Spiller

ASHER P. SPILLER
TAYLOR CRABTREE
Assistant Attorneys General
North Carolina Department of Justice
P.O. Box 629
Raleigh, NC 27602
Telephone: (919) 716-6400

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of North
Carolina*

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
Attorney General of Oregon

/s/ Paul Garrahan

PAUL GARRAHAN
Attorney-in-Charge
STEVE NOVICK
Special Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301-4096
Telephone: (503) 947-4593
Paul.Garrahan@doj.state.or.us
Steve.Novick@doj.state.or.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Oregon*

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General of Rhode Island

/s/ Gregory S. Schultz

GREGORY S. SCHULTZ
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
Telephone: (401) 274-4400
gschultz@riag.ri.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Rhode
Island*

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
PENNSYLVANIA

JOSH SHAPIRO
Attorney General of Pennsylvania

/s/ Michael J. Fischer

MICHAEL J. FISCHER
Chief Deputy Attorney General
JACOB B. BOYER
Deputy Attorney General
Office of Attorney General
1600 Arch St. Suite 300
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Telephone: (215) 560-2171
mfischer@attorneygeneral.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner Commonwealth
of Pennsylvania*

FOR THE STATE OF VERMONT

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.
Attorney General

/s/ Nicholas F. Persampieri

NICHOLAS F. PERSAMPIERI
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609
Telephone: (802) 828-3186
nick.persampieri@vermont.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Vermont*

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA

MARK R. HERRING

Attorney General

PAUL KUGELMAN, JR.

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Chief, Environmental Section

/s/ Caitlin C. G. O'Dwyer

CAITLIN C. G. O'DWYER

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

Commonwealth of Virginia

202 North 9th Street

Richmond, VA 23219

Telephone: (804) 786-1780

godwyer@oag.state.va.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner**Commonwealth of Virginia*

FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON

ROBERT W. FERGUSON

Attorney General

/s/ Emily C. Nelson

EMILY C. NELSON

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 40117

Olympia, WA 98504

Telephone: (360) 586-4607

emily.nelson@atg.wa.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Washington*

FOR THE STATE OF WISCONSIN

JOSHUA L. KAUL
Attorney General of Wisconsin

/s/ Jennifer L. Vandermeuse

JENNIFER L. VANDERMEUSE
Assistant Attorney General
Wisconsin Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7857
Madison, WI 53702-7857
Telephone: (608) 266-7741
Fax: (608) 267-2223
vandermeusejl@doj.state.wi.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of
Wisconsin*

FOR THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES

MICHAEL N. FEUER
Los Angeles City Attorney
MICHAEL J. BOSTROM
Assistant City Attorney

/s/ Michael J. Bostrom

MICHAEL J. BOSTROM
Assistant City Attorney
200 N. Spring Street, 14th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Telephone: (213) 978-1882
Fax: (213) 978-2286
Michael.Bostrom@lacity.org

*Attorneys for Petitioner City of Los
Angeles*

FOR THE CITY OF NEW YORK

JAMES E. JOHNSON
New York City Corporation Counsel
CHRISTOPHER G. KING
ROBERT L. MARTIN
Senior Counsel
SHIVA PRAKASH
Assistant Corporation Counsel

/s/ Christopher G. King

CHRISTOPHER G. KING
Senior Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, New York
Telephone: (212) 356-2074
Fax: (212) 356-2084
cking@law.nyc.gov

Attorneys for Petitioner City of New York

FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

DENNIS J. HERRERA
City Attorney

/s/ Robb Kapla

ROBB KAPLA
Deputy City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City Hall, Room 234
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102
Telephone: (415) 554-4647
robb.kapla@sfcityatty.org

Attorneys for Petitioner City and County of San Francisco

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 26, 2019, I caused a copy of the foregoing **State and Municipal Petitioners' Non-Binding Statement of Issues to be Raised** to be filed with the Clerk of the Court using the Court's CM/ECF system, and that, therefore, service was accomplished upon counsel of record by the Court's system.

/s/ Julia K. Forgie
JULIA K. FORGIE